

CITY OF ST. AUGUSTINE

Historic Architectural Review Board Regular Meeting December 20, 2018

The Historic Architectural Review Board met in formal session at 1:00 P.M., Thursday, December 20, 2018, in the Alcazar Room at City Hall, St. Augustine, Florida. Catherine Duncan, Chairperson, called the regular meeting to order, and the following were present:

1. ROLL CALL: Catherine Duncan, Chairperson
Toni Wallace
Jon Benoit
Paul Weaver, III

Absent: Barbara Wingo

City Staff: Jenny Wolfe, Historic Preservation Officer
Kelli Mitchell, Historic Preservation Planner
Isabelle Lopez, City Attorney
Candice Seymour, Recording Secretary

2. General Public Comments for Items not on the Agenda

(None)

3. Approval of Minutes

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE the October 18, 2018 and the November 15, 2018 minutes as presented. Motion SECONDED by Ms. Wallace and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

4. Modification and approval of Agenda

Ms. Duncan announced that items 6(b) and 6(c) had requested continuance to the January 17, 2019 meeting.

MOTION

Ms. Wallace MOVED to CONTINUE applications 2018-0121 and 2018-0134 to the January 17, 2019 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Wallace, Weaver, Benoit, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

MOTION

Ms. Wallace MOVED to APPROVE the modifications to the Agenda. The motion SECONDED by Mr. Weaver and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

5. Public Comments related to Expedited Hearing items:

(None)

6. Continued Items from Previous Meetings

6. (a) Opinion of Appropriateness 2018-0111 – City of St. Augustine – Applicant and Owner **20 Spanish Street**

To make alterations to an existing parking lot to include adding landscaping, constructing a masonry

wall, and installing paving material, lighting, and signage.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said staff did not make recommendations regarding City projects.

Reuben Franklin, Freemont Latimer, and Jason Hall reviewed the application.

The Board provided their ex parte communications.

Public hearing was opened.

Ron Mickler noted that City staff had communicated with the neighboring property owners who were in favor of the project for addressing the problem with trucks and vehicle traffic along Spanish Street.

Carl Halbirt expressed concerns regarding impacts to the archeological resources on the property.

Les Thomas felt that trucks and service vehicles should be restricted to along Cordova Street. He spoke in favor of saving the Cubo Line reconstruction and the landscaping plans.

Public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed:

- Paving materials to include coquina concrete and pervious coquina pavement
- Concerns for archeological impacts
- Feasible alternative truck parking areas
- Landscaping in smaller planting spaces to be palms rather than oaks
- Curvilinear entrance with oversized curb-cut required for truck turning radius but seemed over-modern
- Reduction of oversized truck parking spaces from three to two with four truck parking spaces total

- Permitted and metered parking spaces with reduction of approximately 20 spaces
- Allowable paving materials
- Possibility of maintaining loose coquina on the north end of the lot to mitigate impacts in the area
- Cost comparisons in terms of one-time expenditure for solid pavement versus continuing maintenance required for the loose coquina
- Location of potential storm water mitigation trenches

MOTION

Mr. Benoit MOVED to APPROVE Opinion of Appropriateness application 2018-0111 with the conditions that there be clear archeological due diligence and that the applicant strive to use a loose shell material consistent with existing paving material on the northern portion of the site as feasible. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.

Further discussion ensued regarding:

- Desired alterations to the entrance due to overly modern design and large 40 foot width
- Necessity to see archeological research and an archeological survey
- Elimination of vehicular access to the parking lot from Spanish Street as a benefit of the project
- Semi-truck spaces necessary for the utilization of the parking lot

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Weaver, Wallace, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

6. (b) Certificate of Appropriateness 2018-0121 – Don Crichlow & Associates – Applicant

Steven and Linda Lohrke – Owner
320 Charlotte Street

To construct a second-story onto an existing one-story Frame Vernacular home and to build a two-story garage apartment.

Applicant requested continuance to the January 17, 2019 meeting. See Modifications to the Agenda for motion to continue.

6. (c) Certificate of Appropriateness 2018-0134 – Don Crichlow & Associates – Applicant
18 St. George Street LLC – Owner
18 St. George Street

To construct new buildings between Spanish and St. George Streets designed with Spanish Colonial character.

Applicant requested continuance to the January 17, 2019 meeting. See Modifications to the Agenda for motion to continue.

7. Certificates of Appropriateness

7. (a) 2018-0160 – Dixon Design Group – Applicant
Maguire Land Corporation – Owner
45 Cordova Street

To make alterations to an already approved Certificate of Appropriateness to include removing the proposed first floor garage and adding a window and door, to install a door on the second story porch, and to construct an addition with new windows and a door.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can take the following actions for the Certificate of Appropriateness for **45 Cordova Street**:

1. **APPROVE** the alterations to the opening patterns and the previously approved porch

2. **CONTINUE** the proposal for the new addition to allow the applicant time to consider an alternate location for stair entry points

Jerry Dixon and Nicole Stearly reviewed the application with a presentation and 3-D model.¹

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Intent to maintain porch detailing previously approved
- Changes included enclosing the stairwell and removing the previously approved garage

MOTION

Mr. Benoit **MOVED** to **APPROVE** application 2018-0160 as submitted. The motion was **SECONDED** by Ms. Wallace.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Wallace, Weaver, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY²

7. (b) 2018-0159 – Les Thomas Architect – Applicant
Dilara and Hamid Hafiz – Owner
164 Avenida Menendez

To raise the building to a finish floor elevation of 14 feet above sea level, to install new rear and front stairways and a rear ramp and deck, and to repair and replace existing front wall.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without

¹ Attached to original minutes

² Brief recess from 2:36p.m. to 2:42p.m.

the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **164 Avenida Menendez** the give the applicant time to address the comments in the staff report.

Les Thomas and Hamid Hafiz reviewed the application with a presentation and additional information.³

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Flooding in previous hurricanes had risen to about 10 feet
- Adjacent home had been raised to 10.7 feet and subject property was at an existing elevation of 7 feet
- Bayfront homes in general had been requested to be raised higher than FEMA recommendations due to wave action
- FEMA requirements had not increased from the existing 10 foot elevation
- Streetscape impacts
- Request would not cause home to exceed 35 foot height limit
- Raising the structure would require additional steps to access home
- Requested height seemed excessive
- Willingness to determine a height that would compromise the requested height and the FEMA requirement

Mr. Thomas stated that the owner would be agreeable with a reduction of the elevation to 12 feet.

The Board continued discussion regarding what building height would comprise the least impact on the structure and the streetscape. There was also general discussion regarding lifting homes in the historic district without heavily impacting streetscapes and maintaining the integrity of the historic district.

Buddy Schauland, City Building Official, gave a brief explanation regarding FEMA, State, and City building requirements that put the minimum elevation at 10 feet.

There was discussion regarding approval of a lower elevation than proposed to one foot above the adjacent home that was raised as well as the Board's preference for perpendicular steps to allow for staff approval of that feature.

MOTION

Mr. Benoit MOVED to APPROVE application 2018-0159 with the following condition:

- That the base flood elevation for the finished floor be 11.7 feet which is 1 foot higher than the neighboring structure to the south which had already been lifted
- That the differential between the architectural elevations presented and the elevations less the 3.5 feet be taken out of the stairs that run perpendicular from the house towards Avenida Menendez

The motion was **SECONDED** by Ms. Wallace.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Wallace, Weaver, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8. Certificate of Demolition

8. (a) 2018-0151 – Sabio Marketing, LLC – Applicant and Owner

³ Attached to original minutes

48 Grove Avenue

To demolish a building constructed in 1956 that is recorded in the Florida Master Site File and does not contribute to the North City National Register District.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Demolition for **48 Grove Avenue**.

Adam Cowherd reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public Hearing

B.J. Kalaidi was concerned with the use of the property as a vacation rental.

16 certified notices were sent, 8 were returned in favor, and 2 had comments.

The Board discussed how the subject structure technically met the age criteria for the district but was so architecturally out of character that it was determined to not be a contributing structure.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE application 2018-0151 based on the fact that it does not meet the criteria as a historic building. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Benoit.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Benoit, Wallace, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8. (b) 2018-0162 – Mathew Pennington – Applicant
Lincolnville Properties LLC – Owner

241 West King Street

To demolish a structure constructed in 1946 that is recorded in the Florida Master Site File and is not listed on the National Register of Historic Places.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Demolition for **241 West King Street**.

Mathew Pennington reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

Mark Sekunna was in favor of the application but was concerned with the close proximity of the subject structure to his own.

B.J. Kalaidi asked regarding whether the applicant was allowed to speak for the new owner of the property which the applicant confirmed and the new owner attested to.

Public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed that the subject property would likely be considered part of the King Street Entry Corridor which was being re-evaluated; however, the building was in poor structural condition.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Demolition application 2018-0162, 241 West King Street, based on the fact that it does not meet the code for a historic structure and based on the distressed condition of the building. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wallace.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wallace, Benoit, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

10. Other Business

Ms. Wolfe announced the Joint Workshop on January 9, 2019 as well as the regular meeting on January 17, 2019. She also noted the upcoming CLG and CAMP training proposed for March 25-26, 2019.

10. Review of Conflict Statements from Previous Meetings

(None)

11. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:21 P.M.⁴



Catherine Duncan, Chairperson

⁴ Transcribed by Candice Seymour