

## CITY OF ST. AUGUSTINE

### Historic Architectural Review Board Regular Meeting October 18, 2018

The Historic Architectural Review Board met in formal session at 1:00 P.M., Thursday, October 18, 2018, in the Alcazar Room at City Hall, St. Augustine, Florida. Barbara Wingo, Acting-Chairperson, called the regular meeting to order, and the following were present:

#### 1. ROLL CALL:

Barbara Wingo, Acting Chairperson  
Jon Benoit  
Paul Weaver  
H. Randal Roark

#### Absent:

Toni Wallace, excused  
Catherine Duncan, excused

#### City Staff:

Jenny Wolfe, Historic Preservation Officer  
Kelli Mitchell, Historic Preservation Planner  
Isabelle Lopez, City Attorney  
Candice Seymour, Recording Secretary

#### 2. General Public Comments for Items not on the Agenda

(None)

#### 3. Approval of Minutes

##### MOTION

Mr. Benoit MOVED to APPROVE the September 13, 2018 joint meeting minutes and the September 20, 2018 regular meeting minutes as presented. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Weaver and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

#### 4. Modification and approval of Agenda

##### MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE the Agenda with no modifications. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Benoit and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

#### 5. Expedited Hearing items

5. (a) 2018-0127 – Michael Davis –  
Applicant  
Len Tucker – Owner  
30 St. George Street

To install four 8' by 8" posts to support the second story balcony.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can APPROVE a Certificate of Appropriateness for 30 St. George Street with the following conditions:

- The applicant provides a paint sample for the columns to staff
- The applicant obtains a license agreement if needed

Mike Davis agreed to the staff's recommendations.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

B.J. Kalaidi asked for clarification of the address which was determined to be 30 St. George Street.

Public hearing was closed.

#### **MOTION**

**Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE application 2018-0127. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Roark.**

There was a brief discussion regarding the condition of previously existing posts to support balcony which staff stated was unclear, though historic documents did note the previous existence of a two-story front porch.

#### **VOTE ON MOTION:**

**AYES: Weaver, Roark, Benoit, Wingo**

**NAYES: NONE**

**MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

#### **6. Continued Items from Previous Meetings**

##### **6. (a) 2018-0117 – Pete Peaver –**

**Applicant**

**Pete and Jan Peaver – Owner**

**19 Rohde Avenue**

**To demolish a building constructed in 1904 that is a contributing building to the North City Historic District and is listed on the Florida Master Site File.**

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can APPROVE a Certificate of Demolition for 19 Rohde Avenue with the following condition:

- Recording of the structure for archival purposes prior to demolition to include photographs and scaled measured drawings that will be submitted by the applicant to the

Florida Master Site File with courtesy copy provided to staff

Pete and Jan Peaver were available for questions.

#### **Ex Parte Communication:**

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Additional information regarding the condition of the building and the engineer's resume had been provided per previous Board requests
- Report was thorough in detailing issues with structural condition
- Architecture of the replacement structure which was intended to be similar in style to other homes in the area
- Clarifying that the applicant was amenable to the condition of recording the structure as recommended by staff
- Adding the condition that the applicant not be issued a demolition permit until they have submitted drawings sufficient to receive a building permit
- Certificates of demolition expired after one year with an additional 6 month extension at the applicant's request

#### **MOTION**

**Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Demolition application 2018-0117 with the conditions that the structure be recorded for archival purposes prior to demolition to include photographs and scaled measured drawings that will be submitted by the applicant to the Florida Master Site File**

with courtesy copy provided to staff and that a demolition permit not be issued until documents sufficient for a building permit are submitted to staff. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Benoit.

**VOTE ON MOTION:**

**AYES:** Weaver, Benoit, Roark, Wingo

**NAYES:** NONE

**MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

**6. (b) 2018-0118 – Charles M. Sapp and  
Emily S. Pugh – Applicant and Owner  
160 Oneida Street**

To demolish a building constructed in 1894 that is a contributing building to the Lincolnville National Register Historic District and that is listed on the Florida Master Site File.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Demolition for **160 Oneida Street** to provide the applicant time to confirm whether the building faces structural failure and/or whether the building can be feasibly salvaged.

Charles Sapp was available for questions and gave a brief history of his search for an engineer to provide a condition assessment report.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed the following:

- Condition assessment report was not dated and Mr. Sapp clarified that the final inspection had been October 8, 2018 and the inspection process had begun after the previous meeting

- Important historical associations and structural integrity
- Assessment did not address or describe a lack of structural integrity in the building

Mr. Sapp stated that second floor joists were not properly supported and that renovations to the structure had caused structural deficiencies. He stated that costs to restore the home were outside their financial means.

The Board continued discussing the following:

- Substantial improvement requirements in the code may require that the structure be raised if the applicant restored the home
- Proof of economic hardship if the applicant wished to go that route including the estimated costs of rehabilitating the structure versus constructing a replacement

**MOTION**

**Mr. Weaver MOVED to CONTINUE application 2018-0118 to the January 17, 2018 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Benoit.**

**VOTE ON MOTION:**

**AYES:** Weaver, Benoit, Roark, Wingo

**NAYES:** NONE

**MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

**7. Certificates of Demolition**

**7. (a) 2018-0126 – Carolyn Moore and  
Troy Blevins – Applicant  
Carolyn Moore – Owner  
91 Coquina Avenue**

To demolish a building constructed in 1959 that is listed in the Florida Master Site File and not listed in a National Register Historic District.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Demolition for **91 Coquina Avenue**.

Troy Blevins and Carolyn Moore provided pictures that illustrated the waterlines within the structure created by Hurricanes Matthew and Irma.<sup>1</sup>

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

11 certified notices were sent and 2 were returned in favor.

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed the fact that the structure did not meet conditions for denial

#### **MOTION**

**Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Demolition application 2018-0126, 91 Coquina Avenue. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Benoit.**

#### **VOTE ON MOTION:**

**AYES: Weaver, Benoit, Roark, Wingo**

**NAYES: NONE**

**MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**

#### **8. Other Business**

Ms. Wolfe advised the Board that elections for Chair and Vice-chair would be held next month.

#### **10. Review of Conflict Statements from Previous Meetings**

(None)

#### **11. Adjournment**

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 1:57 P.M.<sup>2</sup>

  
**Antoinette Wallace, Chairperson**  
**Catharine Duncan**

<sup>1</sup> Attached to original minutes

<sup>2</sup> Transcribed by Candice Seymour