

CITY OF ST. AUGUSTINE

Historic Architectural Review Board Regular Meeting September 20, 2018

The Historic Architectural Review Board met in formal session at 1:00 P.M., Thursday, September 20, 2018, in the Alcazar Room at City Hall, St. Augustine, Florida. Antoinette (Toni) Wallace, Chairperson, called the regular meeting to order, and the following were present:

1. ROLL CALL:

Toni Wallace, Chairperson
Catherine Duncan, Vice-Chairperson
Barbara Wingo
Jon Benoit
Paul Weaver, III

City Staff:

Jenny Wolfe, Historic Preservation Officer
Kelli Mitchell, Historic Preservation Planner
Isabelle Lopez, City Attorney
Candice Seymour, Recording Secretary

2. General Public Comments for Items not on the Agenda

The Board heard comments from the following members of the public:

- Blake Sauder
- B.J.Kalaid

3. Approval of Minutes

MOTION

Mr. Benoit MOVED to APPROVE the August 16, 2018 minutes as presented. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Weaver and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

4. Modification and approval of Agenda

Ms. Wallace announced that the applicant for item 6(c) had requested a continuance from the October meeting to the November meeting.

During discussion regarding the excessive number of continuances for the application, Staff clarified that the applicant had been working with staff, and may need more time.

MOTION

Ms. Duncan MOVED to CONTINUE application F2018-0064 to the November 15, 2018 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Duncan, Weaver, Benoit, Wingo, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE the modifications to the Agenda. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Benoit and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

5. Public Comments related to Expedited Hearing items:

(None)

6. Continued Items from Previous Meetings

6. (a) Certificate of Appropriateness
2018-0107 – Don Crichlow & Associates
– Applicant
18 St. George Street LLC – Owner
18 St. George Street

To construct new buildings between Spanish and St. George Streets designed with Spanish Colonial character.

Mr. Weaver recused himself as a consultant for the applicant.¹

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **18 St. George Street** to address the comments from the previous HARB meeting.

Don Crichlow reviewed the application with a presentation.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

Melinda Rakoncaj was concerned with the lot coverage and the project's lack of consistency with the Second Spanish Period.

Robert Hall felt that the Board had an opportunity to create authenticity in this location. He felt that malls did not belong within the HP district and if the guidelines were upheld, the property could have good ambiance.

Sandra Parks believed the Board and the applicant had served their duties; however, she was concerned with the proliferation of mini-malls along St. George Street. She urged the Board to help develop restrictions that would inhibit the construction and

development of mini-malls in the historic districts.

Dan Holiday felt that St. Augustine had become over-commercialized and that history needed to be the focus again.

Nancy Pellicer felt that there should be more room for landscaping within the project which would set it apart from other structures along St. George Street. She felt the strip-mall may not be successful if the owner did not find creative tenants. She was disappointed that the project could not meet the architecture of the Second Spanish Period.

Martha Mickler wanted to preserve the quaint neighborhood feel of Spanish Street and the historic feel of HP-3.

B.J. Kalaidi said that the ordinances and Comprehensive Plan did not help the Board protect the historic nature of the area. She knew that denial of the application may result in a lawsuit for the City, but she asked the Board to be good stewards of St. Augustine history.

Public hearing was closed.

Don Crichlow responded to public comment stating that the project met all current ordinance requirements and he felt that the proposed structure would be better than the existing structure.

The Board discussed:

- Preference for single panel doors rather than French doors to reduce the mini-mall feel
- Conflict of lot coverage requirements with an 80% maximum and Historic district guidelines that describe a more residential typology
- Concern with window configuration on the south exposure

¹ Form attached to original minutes

- Seven foot wide gate rather than four foot as described in the guidelines

Mr. Crichlow asked that the Board forgo continuing the application and provide an approval or denial. He stated that his client felt that visibility into the shops was imperative, which was the reason for the additional glazing along the south elevation.

Mr. Benoit explained his understanding that the additional windows along the southern elevation were added after the orientation of the shops moved from an interior hallway to the exterior alley.

MOTION

Ms. Duncan **MOVED** to **DENY** application 2018-0107 because the double French doors and seven-foot gate did not meet the design guidelines. The motion was **SECONDED** by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Duncan, Wingo, Wallace

NAYES: Benoit

MOTION CARRIED 3/1

6. (b) Certificate of Demolition 2018-0104 **– Ronald L. Bailey Jr. – Applicant and Owner** **101 South Street**

To demolish a building constructed in 1954 that does not contribute to the Lincolnville National Register Historic District and that is not listed in the Florida Master Site File.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Demolition for **101 South Street**.

Marcus Bailey withdrew the application stating that they were planning to remodel the structure.

6. (c) Certificate of Appropriateness **F2018-0064 – Crown Castle NG East LLC** **– Applicant**

City of St. Augustine – Owner
NE corner of Cathedral Place and Cordova Street

To construct a 40 foot tall concrete utility pole with an antenna and telecommunications equipment.

Prior to the meeting, the applicant requested a continuance of the item to the October 18, 2018 HARB meeting. See Modification and Approval of Agenda for motion to continue.

6. (d) Preliminary Design Approval for the Design Standards for Entry Corridors **2018-0082 – Hagos Fissehay – Applicant and Owner** **3150 N. Ponce de Leon Blvd**

To review new construction and site development for conformance with Mixed Residential and Commercial Typology.

Ms. Wolfe read the staff report and said Preliminary Design Approval did not include a staff recommendation because the purpose was to direct staff in subsequent administrative reviews.

Hagos Fissehay, John Gilgenbach, and James Calloway reviewed the application, noting changes from the previous application including an additional 16 feet of landscaping, decorative fencing, and pedestrian access added along San Marco Avenue.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

Van Cogley was concerned with the choice of fence along San Marco which did not

appear to reflect the character of the corridor.

Melinda Rakoncay thought that the Guidelines discouraged parking lots along San Marco Avenue and agreed that the proposed fence was not appropriate.

Public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed:

- Applicants positive response to previous Board comment
- Fence design which was integrated with the building
- Efforts from applicant to incorporate San Marco Avenue characteristics into the design of the building
- Larger scale of the building
- Landscape plan along San Marco
- Recommendation of lowering the fence to allow landscaping to interact more with San Marco Avenue
- Four inch caliper oak trees (approximately 15 feet tall) proposed
- Color Palette which was similar to approved colors
- Proposed white finish for aluminum store front windows

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Preliminary Design Approval application 2018-0082 for 3150 N. Ponce de Leon Boulevard with the findings that the applicant meets the intent of the design guidelines by complying with the landscaping, the overall design of the San Marco Avenue corridor and the details that are found in that area, the project meets the standards of a mixed residential/commercial typology that reflects a traditional two-part commercial block with the parapet details, architectural detailing, and the overall horizontal expression of the building, which complies with the design typology

of the corridor, and the project meets the character of the specific corridor where the project is located as expressed through the fencing, landscaping, and architectural design and details.; and, with the condition that the aluminum storefront material be a dark color and with the clarification that the site plan as detailed on sheet S3 govern the approval. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wingo, Benoit, Duncan, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

6. (e) Opinion of Appropriateness 2018-0111 – City of St. Augustine – Applicant and Owner 20 Spanish Street

To make alterations to an existing parking lot to include adding landscaping, constructing a masonry wall, and installing paving material, lighting, and signage.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said staff does not provide recommendations for City projects.

Reuben Franklin, City of St. Augustine Mobility Program Manager, and Jason Hall reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

Melinda Rakoncay stated that the main concern was getting traffic off Spanish Street; however, she was also concerned that the area was one of the few opened spaces in the historic district left. She wanted to see the replica Rosario line and Spanish bayonet retained. She felt that the trash collection and entrances off of

Spanish Street was an improvement and recommended adding a wall along Spanish Street to allow for a more colonial look.

Martha Mickler was pleased that there was an effort to get the big trucks off of Spanish Street. She hoped that the trees would be maintained, and that possibly pavers could be used rather than concrete for the paving material. She was in favor of the wall along Spanish Street. She noted that the area residents were considering making a request that the traffic along Spanish Street and Cuna be reversed to allow for better egress.

Public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed:

- Tree removal would retain existing oak trees; however, two cedar trees adjacent to the trash compactor were proposed for removal as well as some palm trees
- Reduction of approximately twenty parking spaces
- Storm water retention plan would be similar to existing
- Paving materials
- Possible alternative sites for heavy trucks including Toques Place parking lot, Hypolita Street closures for drop-offs
- Concern with use and change of character
- Wall along Spanish Street
- Preference for coquina style surface material
- Concern for removal of Rosario Defense Line replica
- Goal to create more structured, time limited commercial delivery zone system
- Possibility of compromise that would retain some of the existing coquina surface, retain replica Rosario line, and soften the wall along Spanish Street
- Lighting plan

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to CONTINUE application 2018-0111 to the November 15, 2018 meeting. Motion SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Wingo, Benoit, Duncan, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. Certificates of Appropriateness

7. (a) 2018-0119 – Les Thomas – Applicant Historic Fraser Properties – Owner 14 St. George Street (Parcel ID: 197290 0000)

To make alterations to a previously approved Certificate of Appropriateness to include adding fences, pavers, and a walkway; altering the configuration of the buildings on the property; and altering design elements and size of the buildings.

Ms. Wolfe read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **14 St. George Street** with the following conditions:

- The second story connector is removed
- A paint palette for the project is provided to staff
- The owner obtains a License for Use from the City if the balcony extends in St. George Street

Les Thomas reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Second-Story connector which was considered inappropriate according to the guidelines
- Examples of existing historic structures that had previously existing or currently existing connectors

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application 2018-0119, 14 Spanish Street, with conditions that a paint palette for the project be provided to staff and that the owner obtains a License for Use from the City if the balcony extends over St. George Street, and eliminating the first condition listed in the staff report because the structure will be considered one building and the applicant has provided documentary evidence of historic second-story connectors within the City. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Benoit.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Benoit, Wingo, Duncan, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. (b) 2018-0120 – Les Thomas – Applicant
OSH Property LLC – Owner
14 St. George Street (Parcel ID: 197291 0000)

To construct a new one-story building with side gables and horizontal wood siding.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a

Certificate of Appropriateness for 14 St. George Street with the following conditions:

- The applicant clarified the fence height
- The applicant selects a compatible door style
- The applicant receives a variance from the Planning and Zoning Board

Les Thomas reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Alterations presented responded to staff concerns for height and door style
- Door style would be solid colonial
- Fence height was 5 foot 9 inches

MOTION

Mr. Benoit MOVED to APPROVE application 2018-0120 with the clarifications of the fence height, changes to proposed wall heights to meet current zoning requirements, and change to a compatible door style as presented by the applicant. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Duncan.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Duncan, Weaver, Wingo, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. (c) 2018-0121 – Don Crichlow & Associates – Applicant
Steven and Linda Lohrke – Owner
320 Charlotte Street

To construct a second-story onto an existing one-story Frame Vernacular home and to build a two-story garage apartment.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **320 Charlotte Street** to give the applicant time to address the issues discussed in the staff analysis or the Board can consider the following actions:

- **DENY** the rear addition as proposed for not meeting the Secretary of Interior Standards 2, 3, and 9
- **CONTINUE** the garage apartment/new construction to allow the applicant time to address the issues discussed in the staff analysis

Don Crichlow reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

Melinda Rakoncay felt that the proposed addition looked strange proportionately. She said normally adding dormers to the roofline would be the means to add extra space.

Public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed:

- Drawings did not clearly reflect the addition
- Location of home entrance
- No elevations illustrating plate heights or addressing height differences between the existing structure and proposed addition
- Lack of windows on sides and second floor

- Both proposed additions impacted the historic structure, being taller and more massive than what existed
- Possibility of altering the plans to lower the scale of the second story addition and garage
- Turning the second story addition roof so the gable faced the street to reduce the mass

MOTION

Ms. Duncan MOVED to CONTINUE application 2018-0121, 3210 Charlotte Street, to the November 15, 2018 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Weaver.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Duncan, Weaver, Benoit, Wingo, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. (d) 2018-0123 – Paul Thompson – Applicant and Owner 168 Avenida Menendez

To remove six rear windows, four front windows, and a rear door and replace them with two garage doors, two sets of French doors, and a single door; to replace remaining windows with new windows; and to raise the height of the front porch wall to allow for a second story porch.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **168 Avenida Menendez** to consider an alternate location for the French doors and design for the second story porch and to clarify design questions related to the rear porch.

Paul Thompson reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- First floor elevation would not change, but material would be stem wall and slab rather than off-grade wood flooring
- Detailing second story stucco with wrought iron
- French doors will be the same width as windows

Ms. Wallace recessed the meeting at 4:54p.m. to allow Special Budget Meetings of the City Commission to be held. The meeting reconvened at 5:30p.m.

The Board continued the previous discussion with the following topics:

- The existing antique wrought iron fence
- Importance of maintaining the window sizes while replacing the doors
- Possibility of finding a different location for the ground-level French doors
- Recommendation to maintain the first floor windows until an application for a front wall was submitted
- Rear façade with garage doors

MOTION

Mr. Benoit **MOVED** to **APPROVE** application 2018-0123 with the following conditions:

- **The alterations to the rear of the building including the two garage doors are approved as submitted**

- **The first story French doors are not included in the approval; however, the second story French doors, as previously approved, can be installed**
- **Raising the parapet wall and masonry is not included in approval; however, the applicant can proceed with the previously approved drawings for the metal railing over the front porch**

The motion was **SECONDED** by Ms. Duncan.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Benoit, Duncan, Weaver, Wingo, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8. Certificate of Demolition

8. (a) 2018-0122 – Paul Thompson – Applicant and Owner
168 Avenida Menendez

To remove twelve windows and two doors and fill in the openings with stucco.

Applicant withdrew the application during the previous item.

9. Incomplete Hearing Items

9. (a) Certificate of Demolition 2018-0117 – Pete Peaver – Applicant
Pete and Jan Peaver – Owner
19 Rohde Avenue

To demolish a building constructed in 1904 that is a contributing building to the North City Historic District and is listed on the Florida Master Site File.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Demolition for **19 Rohde**

Avenue to allow the applicant time to provide additional information for the condition assessment and information on the engineer's background.

Jan Peaver reviewed the application and asked what further information was needed.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

19 certified notices were sent, 8 were returned in favor and 5 had comments.

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Desired submittal items:
 - Structural Condition Assessment report with photographs from a licensed engineer or architect with proof of credentials
 - Sketch plan of potential replacement structure
- Recommendation that the applicant meet with staff to review examples of a complete application

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to CONTINUE application 2018-0117 to the October 18, 2018 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Duncan.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Duncan, Benoit, Wingo, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

9. (b) 2018-0118 – Charles M. Sapp and Emily S. Pugh – Applicant and Owner 160 Oneida Street

To demolish a building constructed in 1894 that is a contributing building to the

Lincolnvile National Register Historic District and that is listed on the Florida Master Site File.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Demolition for **160 Oneida Street** to allow the applicant time to provide the condition assessment.

Charles Sapp reviewed the application stating that he had engaged an engineer and was awaiting a condition assessment report.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

23 certified notices were sent, 3 were returned in favor and 2 had comments.

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to CONTINUE application 2018-0118 to the October 18, 2018 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Benoit.

There was a brief discussion regarding the possibility of making a case for economic hardship, which was optional, as well as the applicant's option to provide drawings of a replacement structure, which was not required. The Board also discussed alterations to the exterior of the structure that could indicate a lack of historic integrity.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Weaver, Benoit, Wingo, Duncan, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

10. Other Business

10. (a) Discuss and provide recommendation for the Historic Preservation Master Plan

Ms. Wolfe gave a presentation reviewing the Historic Preservation Master Plan process.²

Public comment was opened and the following members of the public spoke:

- Margot Pope, President of the St. Augustine Historical Society

Public Comment was closed.

The Board discussed:

- Means to involve historic stakeholders such as the Historical Society
- Hazard mitigation, threats to historic building environment, flooding and storm mitigation, and demolition concerns were critical issues
- Importance of the inclusion of historical context
- Recommendation to edit for typographical errors
- Document would be great basis and tool for Historic Preservation
- Input from HARB for administrative policies
- Positive addition of annual plan review

MOTION

Mr. Weaver MOVED to SUPPORT the Historic Preservation Master Plan as presented. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION

AYES: Weaver, Wingo, Benoit, Duncan, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Ms. Wolfe discussed the project matrix and noted that HARB input would be needed to

rank priorities and asked for feedback regarding the matrix.

The Board discussed the following:

- Possibility of holding a workshop or special meeting for HARB input regarding the HPMP
- Individual Board members could thoroughly review specific priorities and report back to the Board as a whole to allow for facilitated discussion
- Budgeting and funding for projects, clarifying what needed to be budgeted and the feasibility of each task

Ms. Wolfe asked the Board to consider how the task matrix could be made more user-friendly and contact her individually with any further comments.

11. Review of Conflict Statements from Previous Meetings

(None)

12. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 7:12 P.M.³



Antoinette Wallace, Chairperson

² Attached to original minutes

³ Transcribed by Candice Seymour