

CITY OF ST. AUGUSTINE

Historic Architectural Review Board Regular Meeting March 15, 2018

The Historic Architectural Review Board met in formal session at 1:00 P.M., Thursday, March 15, 2018, in the Alcazar Room at City Hall, St. Augustine, Florida. Antoinette (Toni) Wallace, Chairperson, called the regular meeting to order, and the following were present:

1. ROLL CALL:

Toni Wallace, Chairperson
Catherine Duncan, Vice-Chairperson
H. Randal Roark
Barbara Wingo
Jeffrey Gordon

City Staff:

Jenny Wolfe, Historic Preservation Officer
Kelli Mitchell, Historic Preservation Planner
Amy Skinner, deputy Director, Planning and Building
Isabel Lopez, City Attorney
Candice Seymour, Recording Secretary

2. General Public Comments for Items not on the Agenda

(None)

Ms. Wolfe announced that the applicants for items 7(d), 8(a), and 8(d) had requested a continuance to the April 19, 2018 meeting.

MOTION

Mr. Roark MOVED to CONTINUE application F2018-0005 to the April 19, 2018 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Gordon and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

MOTION

Mr. Gordon MOVED to CONTINUE application F2018-0029 to the April 19, 2018 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

MOTION

Mr. Roark MOVED to CONTINUE application F2018-0025 to the April 19, 2018 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

4. Modification and approval of Agenda

MOTION

Mr. Roark MOVED to APPROVE the modifications to the Agenda. The motion SECONDED by Mr. Gordon and APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE.

5. Public Comments related to Expedited Hearing items:

5. (a) Certificate of Appropriateness
F2018-0011 – Bruce Maguire – Applicant
and Owner
303 St. George Street

To construct a picket fence along the south property line.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can APPROVE a Certificate of Appropriateness for **303 St. George Street** to construct a fence and gate on the property.

Bruce Maguire agreed with the staff report and waived his presentation.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

MOTION

Mr. Roark MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Appropriateness application F2018-0011 for 303 St. George Street to construct a fence and a gate on the property. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Roark, Wingo, Gordon, Duncan, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

6. Certificate of Demolition

6. (a) F2018-0028 – Joe Largay –
Applicant
Roots Construction Group, LLC – Owner
6 Blanche Lane

To demolish a building constructed in 1924 that is recorded on the Florida Master Site File and not located in a historic district.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can APPROVE a Certificate of Demolition for **6 Blanche Lane** with the following condition:

- Recording of the structure for archival purposes prior to demolition to include photographs and measured drawings that will be submitted by the applicant to the Florida Master Site File with a courtesy copy provided to staff.

Joe Largay stated he had the documents pertaining to staff's recommendation and was available for questions.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

25 certified notices were sent, 3 were returned in favor and 2 had comments.

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

MOTION

Mr. Gordon MOVED to APPROVE application F2018-0028 at 6 Blanche Lane based on the review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Duncan.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Gordon, Duncan, Wingo, Roark,
Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. Continued Items from previous HARB meetings

Ms. Wallace briefly noted that some applications that had been continued at the Board's request for more information had not returned with the requested materials and that she would recommend simply continuing or denying the application rather than holding Board discussion on those items.

7. (a) Design Standards for Entry Corridors Preliminary Design Approval F2017-0187 – The Hardy Group – Applicant

JAM CRE LLC – Owner
6 Court Theophelia

To review new construction and site development for conformance with Mixed Residential and Commercial Typology.

Ms. Wolfe read the staff report and said Preliminary Design approval required a finding by HARB and did not include a staff recommendation because the purpose is to direct staff in subsequent administrative reviews.

Richard Hardy read a letter from the owner to the Board formally withdrawing the application.

7. (b) Opinion of Appropriateness F2017-0153 – Don Crichlow & Assoc. – Applicant

18 St. George Street LLC. – Owner
18 St. George Street

To construct new buildings between Spanish and St. George set in the character of the Spanish Colonial

Architecture. (Two versions of the proposed building were provided)

The Board provided their ex parte communications.

Ms. Wolfe read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** an Opinion of Appropriateness for the construction of new buildings at **18 St. George Street** to allow the applicant time to address the zoning issues and consider the site plan concerns regarding the building mass and historic setting of the existing historic building at **11 Spanish Street**.

Don Crichlow reviewed the application with a presentation.¹

Public hearing was opened.

Melinda Rakoncay referenced her letter to the Board regarding how the project did not meet City code for construction in the HP-3 zoning district and the AGHP.²

Lee Geanuleas felt that the proposed structure should conform completely to the AGHP and encouraged the Board to have the applicant redesign the plans. He also stated that plans for neighboring properties had no bearing on the subject application.

B.J. Kalaidi felt that the wall should be removed from plans and that zoning issues should be addressed so that no variance was required. She also felt that the building should be one story.

Public hearing was closed.

Mr. Crichlow responded to public comments including Ms. Kalaidi's concerns regarding the wall, which was a common Colonial Spanish design element. He agreed that

¹ Attached to original minutes

² Attached to original minutes

adjacent properties were irrelevant to the project.

The Board discussed:

- Floor elevation requirements which would be met by flood-proofing the structure
- All existing buildings on property considered in 69.3% lot coverage
- Required twenty foot separation between buildings which was not met in submitted plans
- Concerns with mass, proportions, and depth
- Setback and height requirements for secondary structures
- Two story version of the plans were British Colonial in style and the half story version was Second Spanish Period in style
- Proposed door style nearly two times wider than traditional residential style as detailed in the AGHP
- Recommendation to use massing as detailed in the AGHP for Second Spanish Period Architecture
- Board preference to see twenty foot separation between main buildings as an exterior courtyard rather than an enclosed corridor
- Prior approvals for similarly designed arcade-type structures
- Request for applicant to bring plans that meet all AGHP guidelines

MOTION

Mr. Roark MOVED to CONTINUE application F2017-0153 to the April 19, 2018 meeting so that the architect can bring the complex into adherence with the AGHP for HP-3. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Duncan.

There was discussion regarding making the motion more specific to include a 20 foot separation in the main buildings, clearly define the period of design for the project

and utilize the massing, window, and door sizes as detailed in the AGHP.

Mr. Roark AMENDED the motion to include that the design be based on the AGHP according to one of the historic periods allowed. The amendment was SECONDED by Ms. Duncan.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Roark, Duncan, Gordon, Wingo, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. (c) Certificate of Appropriateness F2018-0012 – Arcadian Development, LLC. – Applicant Red Moon Properties, LLC – Owner 9 Aviles Street

To alter the exterior façade to include replacing the stucco, windows, and doors; repairing the framing; and adding decorative details.

Rodney Harrison asked for a continuance to allow the applicant time to decide whether they wish to instead pursue a Certificate of Demolition for the structure.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

MOTION

Ms. Wallace MOVED to CONTINUE application F2018-0012 at 9 Aviles Street to the April 19, 2018 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Wallace, Wingo, Gordon, Roark, Duncan

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

7. (d) Certificate of Demolition F2018-0005 – Kenneth K. Meiring – Applicant

Kenneth P. Meiring and Patricia M. Meiring – Owner
103 South Street

To demolish a building constructed in 1910 that is recorded on the Florida Master Site File and is a contributing building in the Lincolnville Historic District. (Determined to be substantially damaged by City Building Official.).

Applicant requested continuance prior to the meeting. See Modifications to the Agenda for motion to continue.

7. (e) Certificate of Demolition F2018-0008 – Evelyn Needham – Applicant and Owner
56 Lovett Street

To demolish a building constructed in 1930 that is recorded on the Florida Master Site File and is a contributing building in the Lincolnville Historic District. (Determined to be substantially damaged by City Building Official and sustained damage from Hurricane Irma.).

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can APPROVE a Certificate of Demolition for 56 Lovett Street with the following condition:

- Recording of the structure for archival purposes prior to demolition to include photographs and measured drawings that will be submitted by the applicant to the Florida Master Site File with courtesy copy provided to staff

Evelyn Needham was available for questions.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board noted that the applicant provided a condition assessment report as requested at previous meeting.

MOTION

Mr. Gordon MOVED to APPROVE application F2018-0008 at 56 Lovett Street with the condition to provide photographs and measured drawings as detailed in the staff report. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Duncan.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Gordon, Duncan, Wingo, Roark, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8. Certificate of Appropriateness

8. (a) F2018-0029 – Ralph Molinari – Applicant and Owner
166 Avenida Menendez

To raise the building from a height of six and a half feet to a height of ten feet above sea level and to build a first floor balcony on the east elevation and porch on the main façade.

Applicant requested continuance prior to the meeting. See Modifications to the Agenda for motion to continue.

8. (b) F2018-0030 – Valerie Lee – Applicant
Al Sabatino and Jeanne DeSmedt – Owner
123 Marine Street

To alter the current driveway and add new landscaping and two (4) foot high fences.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence the to the contrary,

staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **123 Marine Street** to provide the applicant time to provide further information such as the drawings of the fences and information on the proposed materials used in the side yard walkway and the area between the porch and fence.

Valerie Lee reviewed the application and distributed additional information.³

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Clarification of easement ownership which owner Jeanne DeSmedt stated was partially owned by both herself and the neighboring property owner; however, maintenance of the easement was her responsibility
- Consideration of fence and driveway portion of the application
- Location of black metal fence to be around swimming pool
- Vinyl fencing as a continuation of existing fence to secure backyard
- Request to see locations of proposed fencing detailed on the site plan
- Ensuring landscaping did not encroach on right-of-way

MOTION

Ms. Wallace MOVED to CONTINUE application F2018-0030 at 123 Marine Street to the April 19, 2018 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Wallace, Wingo, Gordon, Roark,

Duncan
NAYES: NONE
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8. (c) F2018-0032 – Patricia Southland – Applicant
Trustees of the Internal Improvement
Trust Fund – Owner
57 Treasury Street

To plant new landscaping and add new features in the side and rear of the lot.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **57 Treasury Street** with the following conditions:

1. The applicant provides additional information about the well and fire pit design
2. The fountain is removed per the AGHP (**DON'T** "Add conjectural landscape features to the site such as period reproduction lamps, fences, fountains, or vegetation that is historically inappropriate, thus creating a false sense of historic development.")
3. The applicant provide any missing information such as paint swatches for the proposed railing color.

Patricia Southland was available for questions.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was

The Board discussed:

- Property Owner's signature submitted to staff after packets were distributed

³ Attached to original minutes

- Trellis design and engineering
- Removal of the fountain
- Tiles on the well to more nicely mask the well-cap would have usually been wood and/or stone
- Turning well into a gas fire-pit
- Natural, preferably pressure-treated wood for trellis
- Color scheme would match existing colors on the property
- Sugar and Sylvester palm was not an approved plant and should be replaced with an approved plant
- Changes to trellis for final staff approval

MOTION

Mr. Gordon MOVED to APPROVE application F2018-0032 with the conditions as listed in the staff report. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Gordon, Wingo, Roark, Duncan, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8. (d) F2018-0025 – Mobilite, LLC – Applicant

City of St. Augustine – Owner

West Side of Cordova St. near Hypolita St.

To replace existing wood utility pole with a new utility pole that includes backhaul transport equipment.

Applicant requested continuance prior to the meeting. See Modifications to the Agenda for motion to continue.

9. Certificate of Demolition

9. (a) F2018-0031 – Connie Grigg – Applicant and Owner

16 Coquina Avenue

To demolish a building constructed in 1955 that is recorded on the Florida Master Site File and that is not located in a historic district. (Due to hurricane damage).

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can APPROVE a Certificate of Demolition for 16 Coquina Avenue with the following condition:

- Recording of the structure for archival purposes prior to demolition to include photographs and measured drawings that will be submitted by the applicant to the Florida Master Site File with courtesy copy provided to staff

James Grigg was available for questions.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

18 certified notices were sent, 1 was returned in favor.

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

MOTION

Ms. Duncan MOVED to APPROVE application F2018-0031 with the one condition that the building be recorded per the staff recommendation. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Duncan, Wingo, Gordon, Roark, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY⁴

10. Other Business⁵

⁴ Brief recess between 3:17p.m. and 3:23p.m.

⁵ Mr. Gordon departed at 3:17p.m.

10. (a) Discussion and recommendation for the San Marco Design Standards

Amy Skinner gave a brief introduction of the subject.

Jeremy Marquis and Carter Gresham gave a presentation highlighting marked changes to the draft presented during the previous joint meeting.⁶

Public comment was opened.

Melinda Rakoncay felt that there should be a separate Corridor Review Committee rather than HARB having to learn both the AGHP and the Entry Corridor guidelines. She also felt that neon and moving LED lighting should be prohibited. She added that all new construction along the entry corridor should be reviewed by the Corridor Committee. She thought that there should be public comment on staff-level review items.

Charles Pappis was concerned with the allowing landscaping for a buffer between commercial and residential properties and felt that landscaping should be eliminated in favor of a wall or fence.

Public comment was closed.

The Board discussed:

- Mixed Commercial Residential typology eliminated, proposed residential and commercial typologies did not regulate use
- Clarifying building materials, particularly painted versus unpainted wood sidings
- Articulating that the guidelines do not supersede the City's Land Development Regulations
- Legacy Buildings needed further definition and clarification

- Sites larger than a half-acre

There was Board consensus via voice vote to recommend draft four of the Design Standards to the Planning and Zoning Board with consideration of items discussed.

Other Business

Ms. Wallace announced that Mr. Roark's term on HARB had ended and thanked him for his years of service to the community.

11. Review of Conflict Statements from Previous Meetings

(None)

12. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 4:48 P.M.⁷



Antoinette Wallace, Chairperson
Catharine Duncan, Acting

⁶ Attached to original minutes

⁷ Transcribed by Candice Seymour