

CITY OF ST. AUGUSTINE

Historic Architectural Review Board Regular Meeting February 15, 2018

The Historic Architectural Review Board met in formal session at 1:00 P.M., Thursday, February 15, 2018, in the Alcazar Room at City Hall, St. Augustine, Florida. Antoinette (Toni) Wallace, Chairperson, called the regular meeting to order, and the following were present:

1. ROLL CALL:

Toni Wallace, Chairperson
Catharine Duncan, Vice-Chairperson
H. Randal Roark
Barbara Wingo
Jeffrey Gordon

City Staff:

Kelli Mitchell, Historic Preservation Planner
David Birchim, Director, Planning and Building
Isabel Lopez, Assistant City Attorney
Candice Seymour, Recording Secretary

2. General Public Comments for Items not on the Agenda

(None)

3. Approval of Minutes

Ms. Wallace asked for clarification regarding the word "dies" on page four which was meant to read "dais."

MOTION

Mr. Roark **MOVED** to **APPROVE** the January 18, 2018 minutes as corrected. The motion was **SECONDED** by Ms. Wingo and **APPROVED BY UNANIMOUS VOICE VOTE**.

4. Modification and approval of Agenda

Ms. Wallace announced a request by the applicant for item 6(a) to be continued to the March 15, 2018 meeting.

MOTION

Mr. Gordon **MOVED** to **CONTINUE** application F2017-0153 to the March 15, 2018 meeting. The motion was **SECONDED** by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Gordon, Wingo, Roark, Duncan, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

5. Public Comments related to Expedited Hearing items:

(None)

5. (a) F2018-0010 – Steven Binninger – Applicant Historic Fraser Properties, LLC – Owner 11 & 15 St. George Street/Castillo Drive

To add new landscaping around the property and to construct a wood trellis.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **11 and 15 St. George Street**.

Steven Binninger waived his presentation and agreed to staff conditions.

MOTION

Mr. Gordon **MOVED** to **APPROVE** application F2018-0010. The motion was **SECONDED** by Ms. Duncan.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Gordon, Duncan, Wingo, Roark,
Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

6. Continued Items from Previous Meetings

6. (a) F2017-0153 – Don Crichlow & Assoc. – Applicant
18 St. George Street LLC – Owner
18 St. George Street

To construct two buildings shown as one and one and a half stories between Spanish and St. George set in the character of the Spanish Colonial Architecture.

Prior to the meeting, the applicant requested that the item be continued. See motion to continue under Modifications to the Agenda.

7. Opinion of Appropriateness

7. (a) F2018-0004 – Steven Binninger – Applicant
Historic Fraser Properties, LLC – Owner
14 St. George Street

To revise the design of a previously approved certificate to include removal of all existing one story buildings and construction of two story buildings and a one story addition.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** an Opinion of Appropriateness for **14 St. George Street** to allow the applicant time to provide additional details and address incomplete design features.

Steven Binninger and Les Thomas came forward to withdraw the application.

8. Certificates of Appropriateness

8. (a) F2018-0011 – Bruce Maguire – Applicant and Owner
303 St. George Street

To construct a picket fence along the south property line.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **303 St. George Street** to allow the applicant to provide the following:

1. The applicant shall provide a drawing of the proposed fence showing materials, finish, height, spacing, shapes, patterns, hardware, and construction section such that the finished side will face outward (south) and the pickets will have a shape consistent with traditional picket fences versus a flat top
2. Applicant will provide a connection to the building or will otherwise enclose some general area so that the fence functions as a full/semi enclosure versus the visual character of a wall

Bruce Maguire reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened.

Pat Dobosh asked how far the fence would come forward and produced a rendering illustrating that a fence along her property

line would make her driveway unusable due to its limited width.¹

Public hearing was closed.

The Board discussed:

- Forty-eight inch height requirement
- Acceptable picket fence designs
- Desire to see more detailed drawings reflecting staff recommendations

MOTION

Ms. Duncan MOVED to CONTINUE application F2018-0011 to the March 15, 2018 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Duncan, Wingo, Gordon, Roark, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

8. (b) F2018-0012 – Arcadian Development, LLC – Applicant Red Moon Properties, LLC – Owner 9 Aviles Street

To alter the exterior façade to include replacing the stucco, windows, and doors; repairing the framing; and adding decorative details.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **DENY** a Certificate of Appropriateness for **9 Aviles Street** because it does not meet the Secretary of Interior Standards numbers 2, 3, 4, 5, and 9. The applicant should consider revising the current plans or consider completing minor work to stabilize and restore the structure.

David Bishop, Christy Bishop and Rodney Harrison reviewed the application with

¹ Attached to original minutes

further documentation regarding structural integrity.²

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Clarification of changes to the structure including removal of existing stucco
- Concerns for design changes rather than plans to repair
- Design changes included a radius window and doors
- Reinstalling the weather vane
- Reinstalling pre-existing windows where existing air conditioning units were installed
- Proposed movement of door to be ADA compliant would change integrity
- Arches can be made symmetrical
- Decorative tile along top of parapet roof would be replaced
- Consensus to revisit plan that lessen alterations to major architectural characteristics to the structure
- Possibility of partial approval
- Matching finish of the existing stucco

MOTION

Ms. Duncan MOVED to CONTINUE application F2018-0012 at 9 Aviles Street to the March 16, 2018 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Duncan, Wingo, Gordon, Roark, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

² Attached to original minutes

8. (c) F2018-0016 – Tyler Lee – Applicant
Ripley's Entertainment – Owner
19 San Marco Avenue

To replace all wood windows with aluminum clad, insulated windows.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the applicant an opportunity to provide additional information including documentation regarding the condition of existing windows and muntin details.

Tyler Lee, Martin Gould, and Kimberly Kiff reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

Mr. Birchim noted that two issues; the window dimensions and state of the existing windows, were thoroughly addressed in the applicant's testimony.

The Board discussed:

- The replacement window would be located behind the façade of the structure causing the window replacement to make no change to any exterior features
- No concerns with window material

MOTION

Ms. Duncan **MOVED** to **APPROVE** application F2018-0016 at 19 San Marco Avenue for the replacement of all wood windows with the aluminum clad insulated windows to match the existing profiles with the understanding that staff concerns were addressed by the

applicant at today's hearing. The motion was **SECONDED** by Ms. Wingo.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Duncan, Wingo, Gordon, Roark, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

9. Certificate of Appropriateness for
Historic Property Ad Valorem Tax
Exemption

9. (a) F2017-0035 – Harold Dockins –
Applicant
Pamela Dockins – Owner
120 De Haven Street

To certify the completion of rehabilitation work for an ad valorem tax exemption.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **APPROVE** a Certificate of Appropriateness for the Ad Valorem Tax Exemption application at **120 DeHaven Street**.

Harold Dockins reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Secretary of the Interior Standards had been met

MOTION

Mr. Gordon **MOVED** to **APPROVE** application F2017-0035. The motion was **SECONDED** by Mr. Roark.

VOTE ON MOTION:

**AYES: Gordon, Roark, Wingo, Duncan,
Wallace**

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

10. Certificate of Demolition

**10. (a) F2018-0005 – Kenneth K. Meiring –
Applicant**

**Kenneth P. Meiring and Patricia M.
Meiring – Owner
103 South Street**

To demolish a building constructed in 1910 that is recorded on the Florida Master Site File and is a contributing building in the Lincolnville Historic District. (Determined to be substantially damaged by City Building Official).

Item was moved to the end of the meeting to allow applicant time to arrive.

Applicant was not present at end of meeting.

MOTION

Ms. Wingo MOVED to CONTINUE application F2018-0005 to the March 15, 2018 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Duncan.

VOTE ON MOTION:

**AYES: Wingo, Duncan, Gordon, Roark,
Wallace**

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

**10. (b) F2018-0007 – Hunter Hayden –
Applicant**

**H&H Real Estate Investing, LLC – Owner
45 Menendez Road**

To demolish a building constructed in 1948 that is recorded on the Florida Master Site File and not listed in a historic district.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without

the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can APPROVE a Certificate of Demolition for 45 Menendez Road with the following condition:

1. Recording of the structure for archival purposes prior to demolition to include photographs and measured drawings that will be submitted by the applicant to the Florida Master Site File with a courtesy copy provided to staff

Hunter Hayden reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

16 certified notices were sent, 1 was returned in favor, 1 returned opposed and 2 had comments.

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- No substantial damage report requested
- Intent to rebuild another single family home on the property in the future
- Additional requirement to submit plans for replacement structure

MOTION

Mr. Roark MOVED to APPROVE Certificate of Demolition application F2018-0007 for 45 Menendez Road with the condition that the structure is recorded for archival purposes. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Duncan.

VOTE ON MOTION:

**AYES: Roark, Duncan, Gordon, Wingo,
Wallace**

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

10. (c) F2018-0008 – Evelyn Needham – Applicant and Owner
56 Lovett Street

To demolish a building constructed in 1930 that is recorded on the Florida Master Site File and is a contributing building in the Lincolnville Historic District.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said based on a review of the AGHP and without the support of evidence to the contrary, staff finds that the Board can **CONTINUE** a Certificate of Demolition for **56 Lovett Street** with the following condition:

1. The applicant provides a condition assessment completed by a state licensed architect or engineer.

Ms. Mitchell continued, stating that alternatively, HARB may make a finding that the historic integrity is lost or would be lost with rehabilitation and that the condition report provided is sufficient to grant the Certificate of Demolition. In this case, staff recommends the following condition:

1. Recording of the structure for archival purposes prior to demolition to include photographs and measured drawings that will be submitted by the applicant to the Florida Master Site File with a courtesy copy provided to staff

Evelyn Needham reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

23 certified notices were sent, 3 were returned in favor, 1 returned opposed and 1 had comments.

Public hearing was opened; however, there was no response.

The Board discussed:

- Applicant could request the City Building Official to inspect the structure for substantial damage
- Need to see further documentation of the structural and architectural integrity of the structure

MOTION

Mr. Roark MOVED to CONTINUE application F2018-0008 to the March 15, 2018 meeting. The motion was SECONDED by Mr. Gordon.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Roark, Gordon, Wingo, Duncan, Wallace

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

11. Appeal of Staff Interpretation of the Design Standards for Entry Corridors

11. (a) 2018-0006 – Olen Meredith – Applicant and Owner
93 King Street

To appeal staff interpretation of the Design Standards that a metal roof is not a compatible replacement roof material for the 1950s shingle roof.

Ms. Mitchell read the staff report and said the HARB may take the following actions:

1. Based upon the application for appeal and such other information that was filed, HARB may **AFFIRM** the staff determination of no basis for reversal was demonstrated
2. Based upon the application for appeal and such other information that was filed, the HARB may **REVERSE** the staff determination with a finding that no meritorious basis exists to affirm the staff determination

Olen Meredith reviewed the application.

Ex Parte Communication:

(None)

6 certified notices were sent, 2 were returned opposed and 1 had comments.

Public hearing was opened.

B.J. Kalaidi asked that the Board agree with staff determination.

Public hearing was closed.

Mr. Meredith responded to public comment stating he felt that a metal roof was appropriate for the building and would last longer than the recommended asphalt roof.

The Board discussed:

- That an asphalt roof was the most appropriate replacement for the existing asbestos roof
- The applicant's concern with staff recommended dark shingle color and Board's willingness to allow for a lighter color shingle since the existing roof color had faded

MOTION

Ms. Wallace MOVED to AFFIRM Staff 's decision regarding application 2018-0006 at 93 King Street with respect to the type of roofing material but that staff is advised to consider working with the applicant to choose a different color for the asphalt shingle. The motion was SECONDED by Ms. Duncan.

VOTE ON MOTION:

AYES: Wallace, Duncan, Gordon, Wingo,
Roark

NAYES: NONE

MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

12. Other Business

12. (a) Discussion and recommendation for the San Marco Design Standards

There was Board Consensus to move the discussion to the March 15, 2018.

Review of Scheduling Conflicts for Training.

Ms. Lopez noted that Ms. Wolfe had suggested dates for Board member training.

Mr. Gordon announced that he would be moving in the near future and would be leaving the HARB Board at a future date.

The Board reached consensus to hold Board training May 21-25, 2018.

Ms. Wallace also announced that the Florida Trust for Historic Preservation Conference would be held May 17-19, 2018 in Jacksonville.

13. Review of Conflict Statements from Previous Meetings

14. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 3:03 P.M.³



Antoinette Wallace, Chairperson

³ Transcribed by Candice Seymour