

Historic Preservation Element Data & Analysis

Prepared by:

**Planning and Building Department
City of St. Augustine
75 King Street
St. Augustine, FL 32084
March, 2019**

With reference to:

**City of St. Augustine
Historic Preservation Master Plan
Preservation Design Partnership, LLC (PDP)
10 Shurs Lane, Suite 104
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19127
October, 2018**

**The Comprehensive Plan – Update
Historic Preservation Element
Historic Property Associates, Inc. and the Planning and Building Department
City of St. Augustine
September, 1986**

Historic Preservation Element

Introduction

The Historic Preservation Element is an optional comprehensive plan element under Florida's Local Government Comprehensive Planning and Land Development Regulation Act (Chapter 163, Florida Statutes). The City is recognized as the oldest continuously occupied European settlement in the United States. Its colonial roots to Spain, and England are unique. The desire to protect, preserve, understand, and promote the unique cultural crossroads that St. Augustine represents prompted the City to include a Historic Preservation Element as part of the City's Comprehensive Plan. To this end, the Historic Preservation Element contains a historical outline, analysis of resources both built and archaeological, and a set of Goals, Objectives and Policies to establish preservation needs.

Purpose

The Historic Preservation Element helps to serve as a guide for the development and use of land within the City of St. Augustine. This includes recognizing all the aspects of preservation of the city, and the very real threats to the remaining historic built environment, archaeological record, and its unique characteristics. The historic colonial Town Plan, and the surrounding historic residential neighborhoods, and commercial corridors need to be considered from a preservation perspective as time moves forward.

Background

For over 450 years St. Augustine has worked to define itself, and promote its many opportunities. Historically the priorities have been surviving as a military outpost, and foothold in the New World against a constant barrage of enemies including fire, disease, pirates, invaders, bombardments, colonization, Spanish, British, and American influences, and eventually statehood.

Early on the identity of St. Augustine was recognized as unique with a Spanish Colonial Town Plan, and Fort, and subsequent surrounding neighborhood, commercial, and institutional development. The preservation of its architectural heritage, and archaeological record remain a high priority, as well as, its continued livability and balance of culture and economy.

The impacts and pressures of modern living are forcing considerations of balance to protect the quality of life, and natural resources, against a booming tourist economy, and rapidly growing County. The small town, mixed use, urban context begs to be defined and protected to maintain its hard working, charm and character for future generations.

Historic buildings are cultural resources that remind us about our past, convey singularity, and usually add to a community's charm and beauty attributes that contribute to social comfort. Like

natural resources or other physical parts of the community, cultural resources, which consist of buildings, sites, districts, and structures, constitute a valuable part of the community and, accordingly, must be identified, evaluated, and protected. In most cities, the litany of benefits ascribed to historic resources begins with a description of their cultural and social value, usually ending with a statement about economic importance. However, in St. Augustine the singular association of the city with its history and the primacy of the tourist industry, wholly dependent on historic sites, and surrounding areas, has required reversal of that order.

A small city by virtually any standard, St. Augustine nevertheless enjoys a national and even international reputation as the oldest continuously occupied community in the United States and one, moreover that played a role in the history of the New World completely disproportionate to its physical size. Among inhabitants of the United States, the city has long served as the object of interest for its association with the Spanish empire, strange in all its forms to a people reared in the English cultural tradition. For more than 200 years, Americans have traveled to St. Augustine to view with fascination buildings and sites that convey an image that is unique to the national experience.

Virtually every segment of the city's economy, whether directly or indirectly involved with tourists, depends upon the revenue generated by the industry locally. In a highly competitive state tourist economy, St. Augustine possesses an attribute of appeal that no other locality can claim. For that reason alone, the preservation of its historic sites, buildings, districts, and "sense of place" demands the mutual attention and effort of citizens and government.

Vision and Land Use Plan

Over the past 30 years, the City of St. Augustine has completed several planning exercises. The first and largest effort in the late 1980's and early 1990's included the submittal of the first statutory Comprehensive Plan and a complete compatible rezoning effort. This established the majority of the City's existing Comprehensive Plan, and the current zoning district pattern for the City.

Since that initial Comprehensive Plan the City has mainly reacted to specific proposals, annexations, and circumstances that included potential impacts on the Comprehensive Plan. The City has also gone through two (2) required evaluation processes, but no major changes were made to the City's "Plan".

In 2014 a major visioning process was initiated. It included an open dialogue with the community to understand the trends and forces that will potentially shape the future of the City of St. Augustine. For well over a year volunteers worked together to garner input, and provide feedback to develop a Vision Plan that was adopted in June 2015, the *Vision 2014 & Beyond* document.

The Vision Plan developed from this process will help guide the direction and purpose of the City's updated Comprehensive Plan.

In looking at all of the forces impacting the quality of life in the historic city the Land Use Plan has to balance residents, local commercial needs, broader economic commercial needs, and the life of neighborhoods in an urbanized area within a growing County, and increasing development and tourism pressures.

The perspective on the Land Use Plan includes focusing on the core downtown historic area, the historic neighborhoods, and corridors radiating out of the downtown, and the evolution of the more typical suburban development along the main arterials through the City. It is expected that with limited remaining vacant land the majority of new development will include infill, and intensification or redevelopment of existing properties within the existing City limits.

The Historic Preservation Element helps to make the case for protection and preservation of this unique city.

The Case for Preservation

The fundamental purpose of all preservation programs, including historic preservation elements within a community's comprehensive plan, is to insure the retention of properties that are considered, by responsible authorities and knowledgeable persons, worthy of preservation. Such properties may be considered valuable for their historical associations, cultural contribution, and economic importance. Recognition of the contributions that historic resources make to society is well established, and with that awareness has come a change in the definition of what constitutes such resources. Just fifty or sixty years ago, communities focused preservation efforts on singular places associated with prominent persons or great events. Today, historic districts, main streets, and industrial and commercial areas are the object of preservation efforts because they, like great individual buildings, speak to us about the community's history, or, more importantly, contribute to a "sense of place" that makes the community attractive. Likewise archaeological resources prehistoric and those associated with historic development are increasingly recognized for their cultural value. That is particularly true in St. Augustine, where much of the city's cultural heritage is contained in its archaeological record.

There are other compelling economic reasons for acting to preserve historic resources. Rehabilitated and protected historic sites and districts acquire prestige and distinction, which enhances property values. Communities employ design controls in historic districts as a means to preserve an atmosphere conducive to attracting shoppers or visitors or restoring life to urban areas that lost their appeal amid the post-war suburban flight. St. Augustine's experience with its restoration effort, the first major attempt in Florida to use historic resources as a means to revive an ailing urban economy, has been widely emulated throughout the state and admired for its cultural, as well as its economic, contribution to the state and the city.

There are also cultural and social benefits to historic preservation that compel the participation of government in the process. The older or historic buildings in a community give it individuality and unique character, setting the locality apart from others. Historic preservation can also be a reinvestment in neighborhoods, often resulting in a reevaluation of and broader understanding of development in certain areas. Historic preservation programs draw neighborhoods together and

instill a community pride that is socially constructive. By stressing the positive aspects of a neighborhood, historic preservation becomes an agent of renewal, reinvestment, and redevelopment.

The historic preservation element focuses community effort on preserving historic resources that are recognized for their economic, social, or cultural value, and it defines the role of government in that process. Preservation must be a community or neighborhood effort to succeed, and, accordingly, all participants in the process, citizens and government officials, must understand the goals that are sought to be achieved and the means that the community will employ to achieve them. As a set of goals and objectives, the historic preservation element constitutes an agreement on the historic resources that have community value and what should be done to preserve them. By providing assurances that the particular sense of place which distinguishes the community and attracts residents to it will be protected, people are given reason to make a commitment to neighborhoods and to community. The historic preservation element should invite residents to help protect the aspects of the community that drew them to it--its historic character and distinct charm.

For generations the City of St. Augustine left the management of historic resources to private whim. The result was an erosion of the resource that ultimately required intervention by state and local governments and private organizations to preserve what remained of the city's unique architectural heritage. The establishment of local historic districts in 1973 and the passage of a municipal ordinance governing their appearance signaled the city's determination to play a role in preserving at least the colonial portion of its historic resources. Between 1973 and 1986 the city's role was essentially confined to reacting to the plans and projections of property owners. No effort had been made to formulate a document that clearly stated the intent of the municipality toward the governance of its historic character. The result was confusion among officials, residents, developers, and property owners over the intent of architectural regulations and the thrust of what the city regarded as its obligation to preserve its heritage.

In addition to municipal self-interest, there were compelling statutory and legal reasons for introducing a historic preservation element into the city's comprehensive plan. Legislation at the federal and state levels had for decades leaned in the direction of formal planning for historic preservation purposes. The first piece of federal historic preservation legislation was the Antiquities Act of 1906, which levied penalties for damaging or destroying historic or prehistoric sites on public lands and authorized the President to reserve appropriate national landmarks for protection. The Historic Sites Act of 1935 provided the first declaration of a national preservation policy and authorized the Secretary of Interior to begin a survey of nationally significant historic sites. The act also established the National Register of Historic Places.

The 1966 National Historic Preservation Act, a key piece of legislation, called for a systematic appraisal of significant cultural resources and established state historic preservation offices to direct such studies and implement the National Register program, which was expanded to include sites of local and state importance. The 1966 act also created The Federal Advisory

Council on Historic Preservation to advise the President and the Congress on matters pertaining to historic preservation responsibilities. Executive Order 11593, signed by the President in 1971, directed federal agencies to adopt measures for identifying and nominating properties under their control that were potentially eligible for the National Register. The President also ordered review of federal programs to insure that they would not adversely affect National Register properties, if avoidable. Tax legislation in 1976 and 1981 helped to create a more favorable investment climate for preserving older structures.

In the twentieth century there was a growing body of case law that upheld the right of local governments to employ the "police power" for aesthetic purposes. The 1980 amendments to the National Historic Preservation Act encouraged strengthening of local legislation for the designation and protection of historic properties. Many local governments had enacted such legislation before 1980, but came under legal attack, particularly before the 1978 Supreme Court decision in the case of Penn Central Transportation Company vs. City of New York, which sustained the constitutionality of employing the so-called police power of local government for aesthetic purposes.

Historical Overview

Historic preservation is an imprecise term whose meaning embraces the identification, protection, and interpretation of a community's architectural, archaeological, and historic properties. The phrase "cultural resource management" more appropriately describes the process that through usage has become identified with historic preservation. Consciously, or unconsciously, management of historic resources has been practiced in St. Augustine for more than two centuries, a very long time in the context of American history. Within the city, the development of concern for preserving its cultural resources has paralleled the national experience, though within the State of Florida, St. Augustine has often been a pathfinder. Being first has created mixed blessings for the city's preservation efforts.

Colonial Period (1513-1821)

Founded in 1565, St Augustine is the oldest continuously occupied settlement of European origin in the United States. The city's history did not begin then, however, for aboriginal Indians had occupied the locality for centuries before the Spanish conquerors arrived. Archaeological and documentary evidence of occupation by Indians and early European settlers exists in abundant measure. Middens and other archaeological features testify to the existence within the city of numerous Indian camp sites and villages, and despite more than 450 years of intensive occupation, considerable archaeological evidence remains from the early period of Spanish occupation.

The architectural legacy of the city's past is much younger, testimony to the impermanent quality of the earliest structures and to St. Augustine's troubled history. Only the venerable Castillo de San Marcos, completed in the late seventeenth century, survived destruction of the city by invading South Carolinians in 1702. The survival of any evidence of so lengthy a period of intensive occupation in a location that has for the past 400 years

experienced every imaginable form of human and natural impairment indicates that some form of cultural resource management has persisted over the centuries.

Vestiges of the First Spanish Colonial Period (1565-1764) remain today in St Augustine in the form of the town plan originally laid out by Governor Canzo in the late sixteenth century, and in the narrow streets and balconied houses that mark "the St. Augustine style," which has attracted the notice of Anglo-Saxon visitors for more than two centuries. That any buildings, even in greatly altered form, remain from that period is due primarily to the use for the first time of masonry materials, coquina and tabby, in construction. Wars, fire, weather, and insects assured the predominantly wooden houses of St Augustine a relatively short life. The more prosperous residents and the government officials who built houses or government buildings in the eighteenth century usually used stone and located the structures in a central part of town, close to the fortress. Houses on the perimeter of the settlement were made of wood and thereby consigned to oblivion.

Every existing colonial period structure in St. Augustine has undergone considerable change. This process began with the arrival of the English in 1764. The St. Augustine Style did not appeal to the English eye in the eighteenth century. The Spanish "consulted convenience more than taste," wrote one English observer in 1769. Bernard Romans complained in 1775 about the narrow streets, described the church as "a wretched building," and regarded the town as "a fit receptacle for the wretches of inhabitants." The English accordingly exhibited no aesthetic compunction about altering the buildings to suit their habits of domestic comfort, introducing glass windows, interior fireplaces and, of course, chimneys which they pushed through roofs. What they did not change, they destroyed. John Bartram reported two years after the arrival of the English that half the town had been torn down for firewood.

In 1784 the Spanish returned to St. Augustine, which they continued to occupy until 1821, when the United States acquired possession of Florida. The first Spanish governor of the last colonial epoch found the city in shambles, with "nothing presenting itself to the eye anywhere except roofless buildings on the point of falling, or already fallen, to the ground." In their remaining years, the Spanish overlords of the city made a sizable contribution to its architectural legacy. The government constructed the impressive Basilica-Cathedral in the 1790s and residents built a number of substantial homes. St. Augustine was still an outpost on the frontier's edge, but the frontier was growing and fortunes were being made by residents engaged in trade and commerce. There were about 200 homes in the city in 1796 and 300 when the Spanish departed for the last time in 1821.

Early National Period (1821-1865)

Despite the considerable activity, the town retained the basic configuration of Governor Canzo's plan and it continued to exhibit the architectural characteristics that attracted Anglo-Saxon notice. Except for the substantial dwellings of rich merchants and government officials, much of the town reflected the rawness and temporary qualities of a frontier village. The first American surveyor to enter the town found it a "ruinous, dirty, and unprepossessing" place, and he condemned the Spanish for causing its "decay." Buildings soon began to suffer from

neglect. Abandoned mansions were often cannibalized for materials used in building other structures.

A local minister, the Reverend Sewell, wrote about St. Augustine that it "wears a foreign aspect to the eye of the American. Ruinous buildings, of antique and foreign model... and a rough, tasteless exterior... awaken a sense of discomfort and desolation in the mind of a stranger." He said that the view of the city from a distance, entering the harbor, "is decidedly pleasing. Its deformities -- the narrow streets, dilapidated buildings, with their projecting balconies -- are lost to the eye in the distance." He held out hope for a change in the town more to his liking. "This ancient city is being transformed into American features, both in its external appearances and customs of the people."

A Baptist minister who visited the city in 1844 concluded that St. Augustine "seems destitute of all ideas of civilized architecture" and that the old Spanish homes, which he called "rat castles," were "only lit for owl's nests." Another visitor from the North estimated that there were no more than a dozen residences in the town that "would be considered comfortable" in the North. According to most antebellum observers, only the poverty of the community saved many colonial houses from demolition.

Turn of the Century (1865-1920)

A reversal of opinion occurred after the Civil War. A leisure class developed with money and appetite for travel. Many northern contributors to the books and magazines which fed that appetite discovered exotic virtue in St. Augustine. In a typical article titled "Our Ancient City," one writer described St. Augustine as "a place of more interest than any spot this continent contains. Here was Christianity first planted...here was held the ancient Spanish court, with its lords and ladies of high degree; and they tell me the buildings still remain that echoed to the tread of knights in armor 300 years ago. Here Sir, is a foreign city, at this day, with a foreign language and customs in the possession of our great Yankee union. It is a wonder Sir, a great wonder! We keep it to show our sneering European visitors, who say we have not past... It has its ancient story, which it has preserved in an unadulterated state."

By the late part of the century, the St. Augustine style, with its walls abutting the street, overhanging balconies, and narrow streets, had become a familiar theme in travel magazines and brochures. Buildings were no longer described as dilapidated, but were now termed "quaint." A typical comment was offered by Harriet Beecher Stowe: "The aspect of St. Augustine is quaint and strange, in harmony with its romantic history. It has no pretensions to architectural richness and beauty; and yet it is impressive from its unlikeness to anything else in America. It was as if some little, old, dead-and-alive Spanish town...had broken loose, floated over here, and got stranded on a sandbank."

The site which attracted greatest attention was then, as now, the Castillo de San Marcos, called Ft. Marion by its military owners. A travel writer, Edward King, indignantly reported in 1875 that there had been talk of demolishing the two-centuries-old castle to make way for a railway terminal. "Such vandalism would be a disgrace to us," he wrote. "The fort should be tenderly

clung to." Although the magnificent fort escaped outright destruction, it suffered at the hands of tourists who chipped away at its sentry boxes and portals for souvenirs. One observer complained in 1866 that if some sort of protection were not established, the fort would disappear like "the relics of Mt. Vernon." The comparison with Washington's home is intriguing, for only a few years before, Mt. Vernon had been the object of an early preservation struggle.

The economic potential of St. Augustine's historic sites became apparent. "With a little enterprise on the part of the whole community, St. Augustine can be made one of the most attractive of American cities," one writer observed in 1871. Such enterprise was not long in coming. In the 1880s entrepreneur Henry Flagler made St. Augustine the southern terminal for his railroad and, to accommodate the visitors it carried in, built two large hotels. Flagler inaugurated a period of economic prosperity fed by construction and tourism. Many of the wealthy people who spent the winters in Flagler's splendid Spanish Renaissance Revival hotels built homes for themselves in the city, creating fine examples of the picturesque styles that dominated turn-of-the-century architecture. Some, like Flagler's hotels, were designed by prominent or soon-to-be prominent architects.

The theme of industrial America was, as it still is, "progress," synonymous with "new." There was little sympathy for the cultural remnants of the past unless they could be economically exploited. Some surviving colonial structures were razed to make way for the buildings constructed during the prosperous Flagler era. A part of one architectural legacy made way for another. An enemy even more ruinous was fire. Widespread destruction resulted from conflagrations in 1887 and 1914. By the early twentieth century only some 50 of the 300 colonial era buildings remained in the city. But an appreciation of the economic and cultural value of St. Augustine's historic resources had developed. This became evident in 1907, when a women's group successfully defeated an attempt by the city to demolish the stone gate portals which stood at the northern entrance to St. George Street. Interestingly, the incident followed by less than a year congressional approval of the 1906 Antiquities Act, the first piece of national historic preservation legislation.

The St. Augustine Historical Society was formed in 1883 to gather documents, maps, and books relating the city's history. But the Society also worked to preserve historic resources. One of its first acts was to issue an appeal to the Secretary of War to take urgent action to preserve Ft. Matanzas, a seventeenth century fortress astride the Matanzas River, about eleven miles south of St. Augustine. The most ambitious part of the Society's cultural resource management activities was the acquisition and rehabilitation of threatened historic buildings and sites. This began in 1918 with the purchase of the Gonzales-Alvarez House (Oldest House), which the Society still possesses and where it continues to maintain an exhibit of St. Augustine history.

Boom and Depression (1920-1940)

The Williamsburg restoration program, begun in 1923 under the auspices of John Rockefeller, provided inspiration for the rescue of historic sites. In 1935 St. Augustine Mayor Walter B.

Fraser instigated organization of a national committee to formulate plans to save what remained of the physical history of St. Augustine and to develop its historic and natural resources. Fraser approached the Carnegie Institution of Washington to underwrite the effort. A preliminary meeting of a national committee on October 26, 1936 in Washington discussed undertaking a historic survey of the city. The committee reported that "the historic setting should be faithfully preserved to the extent which documentary evidence and other reliable data and resource will permit." A subcommittee was formed to provide information on early history of the city and to begin archaeological excavations.

The committee began its work with a survey and collection of documentary materials in the National Archives in Washington and called for the collection of the East Florida Papers, or Spanish documents relating to the early history of the area. Pictures and photographs were gathered and photographs were made of existing historic buildings in the city. A tentative bibliography of archaeological materials was compiled. The historian directing the work cautioned that no reconstruction work could be done without prior archaeological investigation of the site. Notes were taken on interesting structural remains, including wells, arches, gardens, walls, chimneys, and so forth.

In 1936 the WPA undertook historical records surveys at the national and state levels to discover records pertaining to the history of St. Augustine. A historian associated with the project, Francis Lingelbach, declared that the study of history should not ignore the recent past. He said that the Flagler era was part of a "fundamental economic and sociological development in American history," and he urged preservation of documents and architectural remnants of that era. A former National Park Service archaeologist assigned to the survey in St. Augustine said that his survey was only the beginning of a systematic study of archaeology in St. Johns County. "A complete historical survey could include in its archaeological phase complete studies of mounds and village sites," many of which could be found within the city itself, he stated.

The Recent Era (1940-1986)

World War II interrupted the ambitious program, and at the close of the conflict St. Augustine, like most other American cities, became caught up in an era of frantic physical change and development. The changes began quickly to threaten the city's historical legacy. Despite protests from members of the St. Augustine Historical Society, federal highway planners in 1947 approved construction of a four-lane highway along the bayfront, closely skirting the Castillo de San Marcos. The Society purchased three colonial buildings in the early 1950s to prevent their destruction. With celebration of the city's quadricentennial approaching, city officials and civic leaders called upon the Governor of Florida, LeRoy Collins, for assistance in reviving the restoration concept of the 1930s and providing state support and direction for the program. Working within the framework of the Florida Parks and Memorials Association, Governor Collins named a special advisory committee chaired by historian A. Curtis Wilgus to present recommendations to him. The committee suggested a program that resulted in legislation creating the St. Augustine Historical Restoration and Preservation Commission, signed into law by Governor Collins on June 19, 1959. This was the first major historic

preservation agency created in the state and was designed to exercise responsible management of historic and archaeological resources that the blue ribbon committee judged to have unique state and national value.

Employing concepts formulated by the Carnegie sponsored commission and using some of its research materials, the state commission proposed to conduct a program of restoration and reconstruction of colonial and territorial structures throughout the central part of the city. Initial work was hastened to prepare for the 1965 celebration of the city's founding. Historical and archaeological research conducted by the Commission's staff, in cooperation with the University of Florida and Florida State University, located the foundations of colonial buildings and provided the documentary and research basis for recreating historic structures. The number of such projects completed within the city since the inception of the program in 1959 eventually numbered close to fifty.

In 1971, the colonial "Walled City" was placed in the National Register of Historic Places and ultimately gained the status of a National Historic Landmark District. The City of St. Augustine created five municipal historic districts and enacted an ordinance controlling architectural modifications and commercial uses within them. In the succeeding decade, research continued and knowledge about historic sites and buildings in the city accumulated. Archaeological investigation of the Arrivas House, the first project undertaken by the state commission, had established a precedent for accurate research to support restoration efforts. In the early 1970s Dr. Charles Fairbanks of the University of Florida applied the "backyard archaeology" concept to the study of the city's historic resources, attempting to define the lifestyles and social habits of colonial residents.

A systematic study of the city's architecture was finally undertaken in 1978. Previous research and studies had focused exclusively on the city's colonial structures, but there remained hundreds of buildings and sites constructed after 1821 that in most other municipal contexts would have excited preservation activity. Efforts by the city's Historic Architectural Review Board, formed in 1974 to enforce the municipal ordinance governing historic districts, were hindered by a lack of definitive knowledge about individual buildings outside the colonial period, architectural styles of later eras, and the historical relationships of neighborhoods developed after 1821. Moreover, a new era of growth threatened the integrity of St. Augustine's cultural sites and the ambiance of its historic neighborhoods. Comprehensive planning for management of sites and conservation of neighborhoods was a clear necessity.

The survey of historic sites and buildings, conducted by the Historic St. Augustine Preservation Board, was completed in 1981. More than 2,500 individual sites, buildings, and objects were examined and described historically and architecturally. Individual site reports were completed and placed on file with the Florida Department of State's Division of Archives, History and Records Management and at the Preservation Board's office in Government House. They are now available for review at City Hall. A survey report that contains an examination of the city's architecture, a description of the location and significance of buildings and neighborhoods, a history of its physical development, and an inventory of historic buildings, sites and objects was issued. As a result of the survey, two

additional historic districts, the Model Land Company Historic District and the Abbott Tract Historic District, were added to the National Register of Historic Places. More importantly, the information necessary to make historic preservation decisions became more readily available.

In May, 1983, the City Commission adopted Ordinance 83-10, which reorganized the Historic Architectural Review Board, defined more closely its duties and responsibilities, and provided for adoption of architectural guidelines by the Board. In 1985, the city adopted the Comprehensive Plan - 1980 Evaluation and Appraisal Report which addressed the need to complete a "Historic and Scenic Preservation Assessment Element." The plan endorsed the existing ordinances regulating development in historic areas and encouraged review of the city's preservation policies, including consideration of placing additional districts and buildings under architectural control. In an effort to pursue the development of an historic preservation element, the City Commission applied for grant assistance from the Florida Department of State.

Comprehensive Planning (1986 to Present)

(Excerpted from Dr. Adams essay)

The preservation initiative also expanded in the 1970s to embrace resources outside the colonial city. The Preservation Board completed in 1980 a three-year long archaeological and building survey, compiling information about historic resources that permits agencies, property owners and, especially, the Historic Architectural Review Board to make informed preservation judgments. Employing the information gathered from the survey, the Board's staff wrote nominations embracing two historic neighborhoods, the Abbott Tract Historic District, located north of Castillo de San Marcos, and the Model Land Company Historic District, comprised of the residential blocks situated west and north of the Ponce de Leon Hotel. The nomination papers for listing in the National Register of a fourth historic district within the city, Lincolnville, prepared at the request of the City in 1988, recognized the community's historic black neighborhood. A later attempt, sponsored by the City Planning Department in 1992, to add the Lighthouse neighborhood to the National Register of Historic Places failed because of the objections of the residents.

The City in 1986 adopted a Historic Preservation Element as a part of its Comprehensive Plan. This document provided an outline of goals and objectives for preserving cultural resources and suggested policies for achieving them. In response to one of the plan's declared objectives, the City Commission in 1986 approved an ordinance requiring property owners undertaking development at a defined below-ground level to make an assessment of the property's archaeological resources. By 1990, the City employed a professional archaeologist to perform the investigations.

In general, preserving buildings and other historic resources was left to property owners and market forces. A relatively small number of property owners took advantage of federal tax laws that accorded an investment tax credit for the rehabilitation of historic buildings. Many eligible

public agencies and non-profit entities received state and federal grant assistance for historic preservation improvements to historic buildings. Only within the historic districts controlled by municipal ordinance were changes to the historic architecture or landscape officially monitored.

In the mid-1990s, as the St. Johns County Board of County Commissioners and its staff prepared to move into a new courthouse on the outskirts of the city, St. Augustine faced the renewed threat of a vast, empty building in the heart of the city. In the early 1960s, the same building, originally constructed as the Casa Monica Hotel in the late 19th century, had remained vacant for over thirty years before its conversion to the county courthouse. In the same period, its two companion buildings, the Ponce de Leon Hotel and the Alcazar Hotel, likewise empty or about to be vacated, found useful new lives, the first as a centerpiece for a four-year college and the second as a museum and municipal office building. The Casa Monica was rescued a second time through adaptive re-use, returned to its original purpose as a hotel. The facility breathed new economic vitality into the city, like the two other Flagler-era hotels. Both St. Johns County and the City of St. Augustine adopted a state-authorized ad valorem tax relief provision to encourage rehabilitation of the Casa Monica Hotel and other eligible historic buildings.

The Historic St. Augustine Preservation Board experienced some fitful years after 1988, resulting in a one-year legislative abolishment of the agency in 1990-1991. When it was reconstituted, the Board was placed under close control from Tallahassee. The apathy of state officials toward maintaining the historic program became increasingly apparent. Faced with growing evidence that the Board's years were numbered, St. Augustine's Mayor and City Manager began quietly in 1993 to inquire about the costs and problems associated with the City's assumption of the program's management. When the State Legislature ended the program in 1997, the Florida Department of State gave the City a five-year lease upon the buildings and properties that had been assembled during the state's thirty-six years of operation and responsibility for managing the museums associated with those properties. The City Commission established a new department to administer the former state program and also subsequently approved the acquisition of additional properties in the area associated with the Restoration, indicating a municipal purpose to continue the work.

The City's Planning Department sponsored an updated survey of historic buildings in 1998. As the municipal department responsible for the Historic Architectural Review Board and the archeological program, as well as review of ad valorem tax relief applications, it has, by a process of default, become the only identifiable entity in the city that exercises an active historic preservation role. Architectural preservation outside of the historic districts controlled by municipal ordinance essentially relies on incentives provided under state and federal tax laws. Archaeological research continues, under the auspices of the City and the University of Florida, which conducts annual field studies that for over a decade have centered on early settlement patterns. Historical research within the city that might contribute to interpretation of archaeological findings and to architectural preservation suffer from an absence of any sponsored professional historian dedicated to that work. It is encouraging, however, that at the dawn of a new century that will encompass the quincentennial of the city's founding, tentative efforts have begun to give renewed purpose to preserving the city's historic resources and affirming its identity as a living city with a rich heritage spanning 450 years of European settlement and

more than 4,000 years of prehistory.

(Conclusion of Dr. Adams essay)

In 1993, a varied group of civic leaders created a Vision Planning Project for the next century. A committee was created dedicated to preservation of the city's cultural resources and included representatives of public and private historical or historic preservation organizations and interested local residents. It drafted a statement of specific and general goals for the city in the 21st century. Another visioning initiative was held in 2014 that resulted in 4 principles: authenticity, character, livability and vitality. The city leadership continues to recognize the significance of historic resources and how they play a role in the local economy and the physical landscape.

The city started to recognize limitations of managing 40 buildings and other state-owned property leased to the city and began working with officials at the University of Florida to devise an alternative management plan. In 2007, this action was formalized with *Florida Statutes* to allow the University to assume this responsibility. In response to acquiring management responsibility of state-owned properties and historic buildings located within the St. Augustine Historic District, the University of Florida released a St. Augustine Historic Area Strategic Plan in 2009. Since that time, the University of Florida Historic St. Augustine Direct Support Organization has overseen the preservation and management of the properties including a significant rehabilitation of Government House and installation of multiple museum exhibits. In 2011, the city ceased operations of the Spanish Quarter Living History Museum and the University of Florida oversaw its transition to a private operator with an expanded facility including a performance stage, redeveloped site to represent all of the colonial periods, and increased restaurant and retail services. With a focus on the city-owned buildings, brick and mortar preservation projects are ongoing and still represent a monumental challenge due to varied types and sizes of resources. The Hotel Alcazar has undergone a full roof rehabilitation and termite fumigation between 2015 and 2017 and the Waterworks building in Davenport Park is currently under a long term and full rehabilitation that began in 2015.

Leading up to the city's 450th Celebration, the Department of Heritage Tourism and Historic Preservation was converted to the 450th Commemoration program. The Planning Department contributed by providing support to a private citizen that successfully nominated the Constitution Obelisk to the National Register of Historic Places in honor of the anniversary. As with other major preservation and celebration initiatives, the 450th was a public and private effort to raise money, programming and management of many events beginning in 2013 and culminating on Founder's Day, 8 September 2015, commemorating the 1565 landing of Pedro Menendez de Aviles. The celebration highlighted the multicultural history of St. Augustine's past and present, providing a reminder of its historical significance.

An architectural survey was completed in the North City area in 2006 to continue the survey update begun for the city in 1998. It was not until a resurgence of state grant funding allowed for substantial preservation projects to continue. The significant portion of the city not surveyed at all since the original 1980 survey was Davis Shores/Anastasia Island. Because this area developed primarily in the mid-century time period buildings were not candidates for the 1980 survey and

were not represented in the architectural inventory of the city. In 2015, one year prior to the devastation of Hurricane Matthew, an architectural survey was performed. The following year, a survey update of the St. Augustine Town Plan National Register Historic District was completed which also performed an evaluation of the integrity of historic resources for the Town Plan National Historic Landmark District. A marker program was undertaken to ensure that the original remaining colonial buildings and individually designated buildings are recognized and interpreted to visitors and residents.

Another major step forward was the grant-funded project to inventory the major archaeological excavations performed within the boundaries of the 18th century town plan. This information, coupled with the evaluation of historic resources, will contribute to planning considerations as well as the National Park Service's initiative to update the Town Plan National Historic Landmark District to modern standards supported by archaeological resources, historic structures and buildings and the town plan landscape.

Additional National Register nominations have been performed or are underway which celebrate the city's founding heritage, diversity and its recent past along with the city's humbled influence on the Civil Rights Movement. In 2014, St. Augustine honored the 50th anniversary of the passage of the Civil Rights Act. Subsequent research documented in the nomination of the Municipal Miniature Golf Course identified it as the first local public facility to be officially desegregated. A multiple property nomination to document the historic context of the Civil Rights Movement in St. Augustine was submitted to the Florida Division of Historical Resources and will result in multiple sites being listed in the National Register. Since 2010, the city nominated the Fullerwood Park, Nelmar Terrace, and North City National Register Historic Districts.

Preserving St. Augustine's Past into the Future

The implementation of the city's preservation program has had many successes and faced many challenges. Its success can be measured in the ongoing desirability of the city's citizens, business owners, institutions and visitors to experience and benefit from St. Augustine's unique historic character. However, the increased desirability also presents a challenge as development, which is often preceded by demolition, erodes the city's neighborhoods and sense of place. This issue is further complicated by the effects of sea level rise and the impact to the built environment and archaeological resources.

The Historic Architectural Review Board ordinance and the accompanying Architectural Guidelines for Historic Preservation (AGHP), as well as the Archaeological Preservation Ordinance, have served to protect the historic core of the city. It now faces intensified development pressures from a changing population and economy, modern building codes, technologies, and heightened sense of vulnerability. To maintain St. Augustine's unique qualities and manage the development pressure, a present day, holistic review of the city's historic resources is required.

The city's historic preservation program includes both the built environment and the below ground resources that contain information in the archaeological record. All resources that constitute the cultural inventory of the city need to be preserved and/or documented and are under

the auspice of the city's historic preservation program. This includes the cultural landscape, archaeological sites, buildings, objects, districts, cemeteries, submerged sites and features, and significant elements of the streetscape. In total, these features begin to tell the whole story of St. Augustine from the Native American experience, Spanish Colonial mission sites, and outpost of the Spanish and British military through American Territorial and United States historic periods. The first step in planning for the protection of these resources is their identification.

Based upon the current and anticipated development pressure, as well as priorities established by the city-wide review, the historic preservation program can be modified to play a larger role in the city's planning efforts, balancing the cherished sense of place with continued demolitions, new development, and adaptation in response to sea level rise and other environmental threats.

Description of Architectural Resources

Needs to be updated

The built environment of St. Augustine is unique for a state whose intensive era of development occurred within a relatively short period of time in the twentieth century. The built environment is unique, moreover, for a nation in which most development has a definite northern European tradition. The built environment of St. Augustine represents the evolution of 450 years of change, with each major period, Spanish, British, and American, contributing a thread to the current urban fabric.

St Augustine still exhibits the first town plan in the United States and contains buildings and structures dating from the late seventeenth century. The remnants of the city's Hispanic past appeal to visitors and scholars from all parts of the United States, Latin America, and Europe. Post-colonial development, most evident in the monumental late nineteenth century buildings designed by some of America's foremost architects, has contributed to St Augustine's diverse architectural heritage, as has the "Restoration Area", in which the colonial legacy of the city and state is represented and interpreted within a viable, living community.

Town Plan

Much of the ambiance of St Augustine is the result of the colonial Town Plan, an irregular checkerboard pattern of streets that was designed for the needs of the city's inhabitants centuries ago. The Town Plan includes an approximately twenty-two-block area bounded by the Matanzas River, Orange, Cordova, and St. Francis streets. Although the early governors and settlers modified the 1563 and 1573 royal ordinances regulating the laying out of settlements in the New World, the urban plan of the colonial section of St. Augustine nevertheless resembles hundreds of other town plans throughout Spanish America. The plaza, narrow thoroughfares, and smaller blocks of the sixteenth-century plan have survived relatively intact in the area south of the plaza to St. Francis Street, as have the street patterns of later colonial growth. The Town Plan encompassing maximum colonial development, the

urban area enclosed by the early eighteenth-century defense lines, was designated in 1970 as a National Historic Landmark on the National Register of Historic Places.

Patterns of colonial development, however, exerted a powerful influence on development in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries as well. Although the Spanish confined their urban activities to the area between present-day Orange, St. Francis, and Cordova streets and the bayfront, the Town Plan that evolved outside the colonial city was a function of the subdividing of homesteads that the Spanish governors granted in the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries. As a result, many subdivision and street patterns correspond closely to the boundaries of late colonial land grants. A number of streets outside the colonial city also date from the Late Colonial Period, including Kings Ferry and Bridge Streets (British Period) and San Marco Avenue (Second Spanish Period). Because of these persistent developmental patterns, the St. Augustine Town Plan, as seen in its entirety, best exemplifies the colonial heritage of the city.

Buildings

The most tangible aspect of the built environment is evident in the numerous old buildings situated throughout St. Augustine. The 1980 Historic Sites and Buildings Survey identified 2,356 buildings that had been constructed before 1930, the standard fifty-year rule adopted by the National Register. Fifty more recent buildings were also judged to have architectural or historical merit. St. Augustine may have the greatest density of pre-1930 buildings in the State of Florida. Almost one-half of the buildings in the city were fifty years old or older, a figure which would be substantially higher if the hundreds of residences and businesses in the two essentially post-World War II developments, Davis Shores and Ravenswood, were not excluded from the total. Many neighborhoods, particularly in the Southwest Peninsula and the southern section of North City, consist almost entirely of pre-1930 buildings, and modern intrusions generally are limited to their perimeters.

Among the buildings surveyed in 1980, 73.9% were constructed in the twentieth century, 25.1% in the nineteenth century, and less than 1% in the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. In 1986 thirty-five building survived from the colonial period. The Castillo de San Marcos, the nation's oldest masonry fort, is also the oldest extant structure in St. Augustine, having been built between 1672 and 1695. Despite historical and contemporary claims to the contrary, no domestic structures survived the 1702 destruction of the city at the hands of the invading South Carolinians. In 1986, thirteen buildings dated from the late First Spanish Period (1702-1763), one building from the British Period (1762-1784), and twenty-one buildings from the Second Spanish Period (1784-1821).

In 1986 only eighteen buildings constructed in the Territorial-Early Statehood Period (1821-1865) had survived, two-thirds of them within the colonial city area, although it must be remembered that relatively little new construction took place in St. Augustine during these years. However, those at 22 and 23 Water Street and 19 Joiner Street in Abbott Tract, 115 Bridge Street in Dumas Tract, 102 King Street on the former Anderson estate, and 9 Martin Luther King Avenue on the former Foster estate represent the oldest buildings lying outside

the boundaries of the walled city area and, as pioneer buildings and homesteads, set patterns for subsequent development in their respective neighborhoods.

The 147 buildings built in the two-decade recovery from the Civil War form the first significant cluster of buildings outside the colonial city, particularly in subdivisions like Abbott Tract and the eastern portion of Dumas Tract. In 1986 almost 23% of the buildings surveyed were constructed during the Flagler Era, St. Augustine's economic and cultural renaissance of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries (1885-1904). St. Augustine's best examples of post-colonial architecture are found in this period, especially in the 1885-1899 span, as wealthy northerners filled the monumental hotels and churches and built stately residences in the colonial city area or immediately to the west in Flagler's Model Land Company Subdivision. Other subdivisions containing a high concentration of Flagler Era buildings include: City of St. Augustine Blocks 46 A-C and E-J, Masters Tract, Garnett Addition, Abbott Tract, Williams Addition, east Dumas Tract, Atwood Tract, Genovar Addition, and Buena Esperanza.

Two-thirds of the surveyed buildings in 1986 were constructed between 1904 and 1930, although over 62% of these date from the Boom Period following the First World War. Most of the buildings in the 1917-1930 period were built either in new subdivisions in outlying areas such as Fullerwood and Nelmar Terrace or in neighborhoods such as Rhode and Carvers subdivisions that were first developed in the Flagler Era, but were never extensively built up after that era. Twenty-eight of the fifty post-1930 buildings were built in the 1960s and 1970s by the Historic St. Augustine Preservation Board, the St. Augustine Restoration Foundation, Inc., and the St. Augustine Historical Society, as historic reconstructions in areas within the colonial city. The remaining twenty-two newer buildings were either owned or occupied by prominent personalities, or possessed sufficient architectural merit, such as the Neoclassical Revival school building at 47 Orange Street.

In 1986, eighty percent of the buildings could not be described in terms of any well-defined architectural style and were therefore listed as Frame or Masonry Vernacular. These buildings represent a wide range of types, from the one-story simple frame house to the two-story residence with extensive decorative gingerbread, and from the basic concrete block rectangular shell to the massive brick tobacco factory. The next two most common styles are, not surprisingly, Bungalow (4.8%) and Mediterranean Revival (4.7%), the most popular types constructed throughout the city during the Florida Boom Period. Fifty-five buildings (2.2%), all located within the colonial city, are built in the Spanish Colonial style, although thirty are indigenous to colonial structures and twenty-five are historic reconstructions. A related style, the St. Augustine Colonial Revival, was quite popular in the 1960s and early 1970s as property owners remodeled twenty-two older buildings (0.9%), almost all within the colonial city, into Spanish-looking structures. Fifty-three Colonial Revival buildings (2.2%) are still standing throughout St. Augustine, but more commonly in Model Land Company, Abbott Tract, and Fullerwood subdivisions. Quite surprisingly, St. Augustine has only fifteen surviving Queen Anne Style buildings (0.6%), most of which are modest examples of the style, despite the popularity of the style during Flagler Era growth. Perhaps one explanation is that many of the

well-to-do Northerners regarded their homes here merely as winter cottages and temporary quarters.

In addition to the colonial buildings, St. Augustine architecture is best known for its few, but highly significant Flagler Era churches, hotels, and residences. The monumental Hotel Ponce de Leon, Alcazar Hotel, and Grace United Methodist Church, all designed by Carrere and Hastings, are the three classic examples of Spanish Renaissance Revival architecture in the country. The contemporary Flagler Memorial Presbyterian Church and original manse, also designed by Carrere and Hastings, are outstanding examples of Venetian Renaissance Revival architecture. The nearby Ancient City Baptist Church, built at the same time, is done in the interesting though less flamboyant Romanesque Revival style. All these grandiose buildings are located within or next to Flagler's Model Land Company Subdivision, which lies immediately to the west of the colonial city area.

The eight Moorish Revival buildings from the Flagler Era form perhaps the largest collection of this style in the country and range from the simple at 33 Old Mission Avenue to the ornate at 83 King Street and 174 Avenida Menendez to the monumental at 95 Cordova Street (Cordova Hotel). Other styles also evident from the Flagler years include two Second Empire buildings (8 Arenta Street and a remodeled colonial residence at 279 St. George Street), three Italianate buildings (22 Granada Street, 34 St. Francis Street, and 20 Rhode Avenue), and one octagon house (62 Lighthouse Avenue).

St. Augustine has a scattered collection of other noteworthy nineteenth and twentieth century styles, most particularly Carpenter Gothic (the best example is at 232 St. George Street), Gothic Revival (223 and 241 St. George Street), Tudor Revival (57 Weeden Street and 22 East Park), Greek Revival (65 Fullerwood Drive), Italianate (Florida East Coast Offices at 1 Malaga Street), Mediterranean Baroque (161 Cordova Street), Neoclassical Revival (47 Orange Street), and Mission Revival (20 Dufferin Street and 24 Fullerwood Drive).

Update condition from building survey/add section for mid-century summary

Other Features

St. Augustine in 1986 consisted of more than just streets and buildings. Other lesser known features of the urban landscape also contributed to the totality of the built environment. Without these structures, objects, and historical sites, St. Augustine would lack some of its important historical attributes and lose much of its charm and ambiance.

Structures

St. Augustine possesses a number of highly significant structures: most particularly the 1808 coquina City Gate, the former main entrance through the Cubo defense line, the 1872 Lighthouse on Anastasia Island, and the 1926 Bridge of Lions spanning Matanzas Bay. The City Gate, owned by the National Park Service, is in a good state of preservation. The Lighthouse is well maintained, and the Keeper's Quarters is fully restored. The facility is a

significant resource to appreciate and promote the maritime heritage of the city. After a proposal to widen the Bridge of Lions was withdrawn in the early 1980's a major rehabilitation was completed to restore the bridge to its original look with some safety improvements. However, it is still a two-lane draw bridge limiting function, and impacting traffic flow along the bayfront. Additional traffic in the area still poses a serious threat to the integrity of the colonial town plan, particularly in the vicinity of the plaza.

Several historic walls also merited documentation in the course of the 1980 survey. The seawall, parts of which date to 1840, is the most prominent, although three old house walls south of the plaza are highly significant. The south wall at 214 St. George Street (Horruytiner-Lindsley House) is the only extant colonial tabby wall in St. Augustine, and part of a tabby house section can be seen in the coquina property wall that enclosed the mid-eighteenth century Cavedo House at the southwest corner of Cadiz and Aviles Streets. The coquina wall that surrounds the northern portion of the St. Joseph's Academy lot was constructed out of rubble from a two-story house that stood on St. George Street near Cadiz Street and served as a school in the late colonial period. A lesser known feature is the massive coquina base underlying the former Monson's Motor Lodge, now the Bayfront Hilton, at the corner of Treasury Street and Avenida Menendez was part of the Rodriguez-Leslie House built in the mid-eighteenth century and known as the Vedder Museum, destroyed by fire in 1914.

Objects

The objects which contribute to St. Augustine's built environment are generally of more recent origin than the structures, with only one object, the Constitution Obelisk, dating from the colonial period. Several were erected later in the nineteenth century, including the Dade Massacre Monuments (1842) in the National Cemetery, the Confederate War Memorial (1872) in the plaza, the Pell Horse Fountain (1887) next to Government House, and the fountain (1899) behind Government House. The remainder were built in the twentieth century with erection dates clustering around both world wars and the restoration boom period of the 1960s and 1970s.

Most of the twenty-one statues, memorial, and fountains are located in or near the plaza and lend considerable visual pleasure to the downtown area. A second cluster is found at another well-visited site, the Mission of Nombre de Dios on San Marco Avenue.

Historical Sites

The seven historical sites surveyed in 1980 represent a broad range of St. Augustine history, beginning as far back as the 1565 Menendez landing place and subsequent Indian mission site, continuing with the 1740 battery site that Oglethorpe set up on Anastasia Island during the siege of St. Augustine, and ending with the Flagler Era park in west Model Land Company subdivision that fronted the now demolished railroad station, which is the site of the new St. Augustine Main Fire Station. Eighteenth and nineteenth century cemeteries constitute the rest of the historical sites listed. The old, weathering gravestones and landscaping of these cemeteries contribute to the overall historical ambiance of the town and continue to attract

visitors daily. The colonial Catholic Tolomato Cemetery, the oldest visible cemetery in St. Augustine, is situated just outside the walled city area, and the Protestant Public Burying Ground, erroneously called the "Huguenot Cemetery," is located just to the north of the colonial city. The National Cemetery at the southern end of the National Guard complex and the La Leche Cemetery at the Mission Grounds are two other pre-Civil War cemeteries within the city of St. Augustine.

Description of Archaeological Resources

St. Augustine contains the most significant archaeological resources in the United States pertaining to the Spanish colonial regime. As the oldest continuously occupied settlement of European origin in the nation, the city is especially important to early exploration and colonization. Studies in the 1970s and 1980s focused on the adaptation of colonists to the New World, particularly the integration of cultures. Archaeology is an integral part of this process of study, as it has been of preservation itself in St. Augustine for past 80 years. A systematic program of research-oriented excavation carried out under the direction of the St. Augustine Preservation Board, the University of Florida, and the City Archaeologist has continued to add to the knowledge base. The artifacts recovered through excavation are housed by the City, and the University which maintains one of the largest repositories of colonial Hispanic archaeological material in the United States. Much remains beneath the earth, however, and it is such resources that suffer the greatest impact from urban development.

Archaeological sites may be divided into prehistoric sites (defined as those which date, from before arrival of Europeans), and historic sites (defined as both Indian and European sites dating from after 1500 A.D.). Both types of archaeological resources are represented in St. Augustine's rich historic heritage.

Evaluation of Historic Resources

The description of historic resources provided in this report does not constitute an evaluation of their significance, individually or relatively. Not every building or structure in St. Augustine more than fifty years of age nor every shred of pottery scraped from the ground possesses significance, nor can everyone be the object of preservation activity. In the process of planning for historic preservation within the community, priorities must be established. Preservation action, moreover, must often concentrate upon elements of the community that assume importance only in their mutual relationship. This includes groups of buildings or neighborhoods or aspects of the community that are not individually distinguishable, such as the city's skyline or the Town Plan.

This section will examine the community elements that have historic significance and that community officials, planners, and residents should acknowledge in the preservation process. Although it is difficult to establish an order of absolute significance to resources, priorities

must, as has been stated, be set. Principally, however, this list is provided to instill awareness of the conceptual approach that must be adopted if community historic preservation is to succeed.

Another tool that the City has is the adopted Historic Preservation Master Plan. The evaluations, recommendations, goals, strategies and tasks outlined in the Plan will also help to establish preservation priorities.

The Town Plan

Few buildings dating from the Colonial Period remain in St. Augustine as reminders of the city's distinctive Spanish heritage. Aside, perhaps, from the Castillo de San Marcos, whose massive presence provides a conspicuous reminder of Spain's colonial domination, the most significant and, excepting archaeological resources, oldest surviving element of the colonial era is the Town Plan. This plan, which prominently includes the plaza and the street pattern in the colonial section of the city, dates from the last decade of the sixteenth century and is accordingly the first town plan established in the United States. Much of St. Augustine's character is derived from this plan. According to 1563 and 1573 royal ordinances, the plaza in the Spanish town was to function as the principal area of the community and was to be surrounded by important governmental and ecclesiastical buildings. This explains the location of the Cathedral and Government House, as well as the plaza itself, which in the colonial era was used as a recreational, meeting, and market place.

The Town Plan consists of an approximately forty-block area flanked to the east by Matanzas Bay, to the west by present-day Cordova Street, to the north by the Castillo de San Marcos and the Cuba Line, and to the south by the Franciscan Convent (now the Florida National Guard Headquarters). This area, with its surviving historic structures, has been recognized as a National Historic Landmark. Its configuration has remained relatively undisturbed since the plan was designed by Governor Mendez De Canzo. The principal changes to the street pattern include the extension of Cathedral Place from St. George Street to Cordova Street and the extension of the bayfront, which was done in the 1940s. Within this original town plan are thirty-four surviving colonial structures and a rich archaeological resource. The threats to this aspect of the community's past might include alterations of the street pattern to accommodate modern traffic, removal of colonial buildings, disturbance of the archaeological resources, and introduction of buildings or other elements that are not harmonious with existing architecture.

Colonial Structures

There are few structures in St. Augustine that survive from the pre-1821 era and are thus associated with the Spanish or British occupations of the city. Those whose architectural characteristics exhibit the character of St. Augustine's Spanish legacy are especially significant, for they are associated with that aspect of the city's past which lends its greatest historical distinction. The structures range from the Castillo de San Marcos to modest residences. In 1821, when the United States assumed control of Florida, there were more than three hundred structures in St. Augustine. Attrition by various causes reduced their number to thirty-six in the 1930s, when, for the first time,

state and national authorities took alarm and initiated activity to rescue what remained from the period. Many of the structures have been secured through public acquisition designed to preserve them. Many remain in private or institutional ownership that leaves their disposition uncertain.

Restoration Area

Recognition in the 1930s that St. Augustine's colonial legacy was on the verge of disappearing led to the formation of a movement to preserve what remained and to recreate a portion of the colonial city. The "Restoration Area" came under the sponsorship of the State of Florida in 1959. Subsequently, public and private efforts have resulted in the reconstruction or restoration of numerous colonial era buildings and in the creation of a "Restored Area" at the north end of St. George Street. Although many of the buildings within the area are state or institutionally owned, some parcels remain privately held. The permitted uses and the architectural controls established within the "Restored Area" should be more stringent than elsewhere and designed to maintain the special character and the historic integrity that people of St. Augustine and Florida have strived to create.

Several privately held buildings with modern uses, including restaurants, hotels and other uses have been built in the St. Augustine style at the north end of St. George Street. This new construction brings to question whether some buildings within the "Restoration Area" that are now approaching or are now 50 years old warrant protection in their own right or are just vestiges of an aging preservation concept that helped to confirm St. Augustine's place as a tourist destination.

Archaeological Resources

Relatively little of the city's architectural legacy remains intact. Colonial wars, insects, time, and human destruction, often done in the name of progress, have, over the centuries, resulted in the destruction of buildings reflecting the culture and civilization of St. Augustine's past inhabitants. The largest body of material evidence that remains from which the record of the past can be compiled consists of the below-ground or archaeological resources. Appreciation of the need for protecting such invisible resources is often difficult to instill. Like buildings, however, the tangible remnants of the past that remain underground constitute a direct link with history and in many cases provide the only available body of evidence upon which understanding of that history can be acquired.

The value of archaeological resources to our understanding of the past is related to the care and knowledge with which they are excavated and studied. Material objects taken out of their earthen context without accompanying study are generally rendered useless and the ability to gain information from them, lost. It is important, therefore, that measures be taken to insure that before private or public excavation of ground occurs within areas of the city that possess the potential for harboring significant bodies of archaeological resources, "mitigation" efforts will be conducted. This should be completed before any archaeology is allowed. Supervision must then be performed by skilled and knowledgeable practitioners.

Surveys conducted by the Historic St. Augustine Preservation Board and excavations performed under the auspices of various organizations and universities, and almost 30 years of a professional archaeologist on staff at the city have produced a relatively sophisticated idea of the distribution and location of archaeological resources. There are areas of the city known to contain potentially rich sources of material, including virtually the entire unexcavated portion of the colonial city embraced by the Town Plan and the North City area. Other areas, particularly those whose disturbance has been recorded, are known to be archaeologically vacant. The chronological distribution of the resources reaches from prehistoric times to the early twentieth century. Of special interest is the material culture pertaining to the early First Spanish Colonial Period, for that it is not only a singular chapter of America's history, but provides a potential for yielding knowledge about a process of acculturation important to our understanding of early America that can be best studied in the context of St. Augustine.

The distribution of archaeological zones within the city where significant deposits of archaeological materials exist is identified on Map X. Threats to this resource emanate from many sources, principally development of new infrastructure requiring below ground site preparation, street and road construction, and utility installation. Ideally, salvage excavation in advance of below grade work exceeding one cubic meter should be conducted. The minimum level of archaeological preparation for such excavation should include augur survey and subsequent monitoring. Artifacts recovered from city and county lands are public property belonging to the respective government entity from whose jurisdiction they came. Some of the artifacts may be prepared for public exhibit, such as the display at the Visitor Information Center or assembled in traveling lecture display cases for use in public schools to provide a better understanding of the city's historic heritage and the need to protect and preserve it.

Potential National Register and Landmark Buildings

Besides those remaining from the Colonial Era, there are many buildings in St. Augustine that possess architectural and historical distinction. By far the largest part of the city's historic architecture, which numbers approximately 2,400 buildings constructed before 1935 as surveyed in 1980, remains from the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. There is also a generous number of territorial and early statehood buildings that, in virtually any other urban context, especially Florida, would excite significant preservation concern and activity. Especially noteworthy are the Flagler Era buildings, legacy to an architectural renaissance that inspired emulation throughout the country for the more than a half century after their appearance.

Some of these buildings are individually listed in the National Register of Historic Places. Others that would normally be eligible for such recognition have not been nominated because they are located within National Register Historic Districts. Most, though not all, are situated within historic districts controlled under municipal ordinance. Such buildings, like those remaining from the Colonial Period, possess exceptional individual significance and merit special protection under municipal ordinance. These, for want of description, are termed here "landmark" buildings. A prominent example is the Bronson Cottage at 252 St. George Street, designed by Alexander Jackson Davis, one of America's most influential nineteenth century architects. Were this building not located within an existing National Register Historic District, it would warrant individual

listing. Moreover, it is also situated within a municipal historic district and subject to architectural control. Such controls do not, however, prohibit the removal or demolition of the building. A list of National Register and exceptional, or "landmark," buildings appears in the Appendices. National Register Districts, Buildings and Sites are located on Map X.

Additional surveys and updates to the previous survey have been completed adding evaluations and research material of areas including development prior to 1968. This work finally includes buildings between 1930 and 1968 further recognizing significant areas of the city, such as Davis Shores and other "mid-century" structures. The final area to be surveyed is the west side, which is recognized to also contain many older, and a cluster of mid-century development as well.

Residential Neighborhoods

St. Augustine presently contains seven (7) National Register historic districts: The St. Augustine Historic District, essentially the area comprised by the sixteenth century Town Plan; The Model Land Company Historic District, the Flagler Era tract that developed around the Ponce de Leon Hotel; the Abbott Tract, a late nineteenth century development; the Lincolnville neighborhood, a nineteenth century Black settlement; North City, another late nineteenth century development with main street traditional commercial areas; and the Nelmar Terrace, and Fullerwood Park neighborhoods including turn of the century residential development. Excepting the northern part of the St. Augustine Historic District, areas along the south end of San Marco Avenue, and buildings surrounding the plaza, all the districts are essentially residential. Their architectural character and the historic relationships expressed by that architecture would suffer from the introduction of buildings and building uses that did not support their residential nature.

Add section for entry corridors

The Silhouette of St. Augustine

During the colonial period, St. Augustine's Spanish inhabitants developed a style of architecture that consisted of an adaptation of European forms and methods to the New World environment. The result, examined in Albert Manucy's The Houses of St. Augustine 1565-1821, has been termed the "St. Augustine Style" because the buildings exhibited unique characteristics of architecture. Among the features were a respect for mass and scale, the absence of setback, balconies, and a fairly uniform height to the buildings, featuring generous numbers of steeply sloped hip and gabled roofs. The massive buildings introduced during the Flagler Era with their graceful towers accentuated the picturesque skyline which the city had developed over the preceding century and a half. Even the Atlantic Bank Building, the city's one "skyscraper", constructed in 1927, exhibits a cupola expressly designed to complement the watch tower that juts out from the Castillo de San Marcos. St. Augustine thus provides the classic silhouette of a European town. Its skyline reflects the scale and design of the buildings that comprise its historic inner city.

Threats to Historic Resources

This section presents a discussion of general conditions, and practices that may threaten historic resources. In some cases, such as incompatible development, the city has architectural controls in an effort to remove or to alleviate the threat. There is an awareness that problems exist with potential infill and redevelopment projects, and development pressures.

Incompatible Development

The community recognizes that the introduction of unharmonious elements within a historic setting can destroy the integrity and effectiveness of the resource. This is true not merely in the case of historic resources, but with all elements of community development and planning. It is for precisely such reasons that zoning restrictions of all kinds are established, whether these apply to historic districts or otherwise. Historic architectural controls are merely a special kind of zoning and are considered reasonable regulation of property.

Zoning is the most common historic preservation tool and one that at the same time presents significant dangers to historic resources if it is wrongfully applied. The permitted introduction of commercial buildings in a residential neighborhood, for example, can lead to that neighborhood's destruction. The term zoning encompasses a number of land use controls that are discussed elsewhere in this element. Examples are the establishment of historic districts and the creation of an architectural review board to control architectural changes in the districts. The recommendation for creation of a landmark ordinance falls under the realm of zoning. Permitted uses in those historic districts are one form of zoning application.

Among other controls that St. Augustine has established to maintain the city's historic character are the height limitation on buildings, the requirement for architectural review of exterior appearances within municipal historic districts, and entry corridors, the prohibition against demolition without approval of the Historic Architectural Review Board, the sign ordinance, and specific lot coverage and setback requirements for primary and secondary structures, additions, and connections, as well as landscaping and parking regulations. Despite these controls, threats persist. In desirable neighborhoods offering limited area for new development, there may be a demand to introduce buildings that are not in scale with the neighborhoods. This is particularly destructive of single family neighborhoods. Architectural controls were instituted to retain the character of the city's historic architecture and its setting, and should be regarded in that light. St. Augustine's historic character is the product of several centuries of development. The introduction of unharmonious elements within existing neighborhoods and the downtown area may quickly destroy its effect and appeal. This is also true in the National Register District areas, and areas that may be eligible for designation, but are not officially designated, and the roadways leading in and through the city.

At the same time, permitted uses in historic districts should be reviewed to insure that they accommodate historic buildings. The concept of "adaptive reuse" is accepted in historic preservation. This concept is based on the realization that buildings constructed for one purpose a century ago may not serve the same purpose today and that uses of buildings in particular areas of

a city change over time. Modern costs of maintaining a building are usually much greater than in the past and large historic buildings are often threatened by neglect or abandonment for that reason.

Traffic and Transportation

Traffic patterns and transportation loads pose a threat to the integrity of buildings and the historic Town Plan, as well as, the neighborhoods and commercial districts adjacent to the limited transportation corridors in and through the city. Transportation plans should be reviewed and adopted with the conservation of cultural resources, including the urban plan, in mind. Street routes that attract inappropriate or congested traffic through historic areas can be destructive to historic settings. Expansion of Alternate U.S. 1 along the bayfront in the late 1940s, against the protests of the St. Augustine Historical Society, led to its adoption as a thoroughfare and the subsequent development of many businesses on Anastasia Boulevard that now depend upon the route's continuance. Consequently, the Bridge of Lions is a major barrier to free flowing traffic. However, the Bridge contributes to the skyline of St. Augustine and helps to maintain the scale of downtown. If it were enlarged, it would probably invite even greater traffic loads through the colonial grid and inevitably lead to future demands for further destructive changes affecting the Town Plan.

Parking presents an ancillary transportation problem. The issue of transportation and parking cannot, however, be separated from the issue of economic impact any more than it can be separated from the threat that traffic and the need for parking space present to historic resources. Historic buildings, to survive, must, like all buildings, serve a useful purpose. Buildings that serve a commercial purpose generally depend upon automotive access and, generally, parking. That is even truer in urban sectors devoted to commercial usage. To insure the survival of historic buildings, therefore, traffic needs must be accommodated, and it is incumbent on preservation-minded citizens to assist in the search for appropriate solutions.

Additional Archaeological Protection

This element discusses the significance of the city's archaeological resources and threats to these resources. The controls over activity that jeopardizes this invaluable resource must be re-emphasized here. Archaeological resources in many cases provide our only link with the city's historic past. They can be compared to a book, which there is but one copy that can be read only once and whose usefulness is thereafter lost, unless the information is recorded. Once the context in which archaeological resources reside is disturbed and the material object removed, its usefulness and significance cannot be regained. Archaeological features often consist of little more than shadowed imprints in the earth that tell the trained observer much about the past. In St. Augustine, much remains to be learned from the archaeological record.

Building and Fire Codes

The police power authorizes state government to enact laws for the protection of the health, safety, morals and general welfare of the community. Pursuant to this power, the state has in turn authorized the city and county governments to adopt building, fire and housing codes

providing minimum standards for the design, construction, use, and maintenance of all buildings and structures within their jurisdictions. In certain circumstances, the building, fire and housing codes may present a deterrent to preservation of historic structures by establishing standards that cannot be accommodated to the historic structures. A requirement for elevators or wider stairways, for example, may force changes to a building that jeopardize its historic character.

Priorities

Many of the following priorities have been discussed in previous sections of this element and are adopted in some form in the Goals, Objectives and Policies of the Comprehensive Plan. They are discussed here in order to emphasize their importance to protecting, preserving, understanding and promoting the importance of the history of St. Augustine.

Preserve the Town Plan

Protect Archaeological Resources

Strengthen the Architectural Ordinance

Maintain the City Skyline

Traffic and Parking

Buildings

Streetscape

Urban Design Guidelines

Protect Historic Districts and Neighborhoods

Conclusion

Appendices

Appendix A	Historic Resource Details
Appendix B	Archaeological Resource Summary
Appendix C	Maps
Appendix D	Character Analysis